A Quandary at Hebrus: Bacchylides 16.5-8

Marios Skempis
Independent scholar

Abstract   This article constitutes an effort to supplement the paeanic section of Bacchylides 16. The conjectures that I put forward for verses 5-8, set up a concerted Apolline frame. It is categorically retrievable through the interpretational methods of intertextuality and contextuality.

Keywords   Bacchylides. Dithyramb. Apollo. Hebrus. Quandary.

Edizioni Ca'Foscari

Bacchylides 16 contains several problems of textual transmission. Its opening section is improperly understood from a contextual point of view because the first eight lines are not wholly attested on the papyrus – left side is missing. Scholars tend to assume that the entire section hinges on the return of Apollo from his three-month winter vacation in the land of the Hyperboreans to Pytho through a stop at the river Hebrus. This is a theme seemingly not suitable for a dithyrambic narration. What causes subgeneric confusion is that this section features two denominations for song classificatorily not straightforward for or impertinent to the identification of a dithyramb: hymn (16.4 ὕμνων) and paean (16.8 παιηόνων), both of which appear to be linked with Apollo (16.1; 16.10). This dim field of subgeneric diversity is further obfuscated by the severe lack of clarity due to problems of fragmentation.

My aim in this article is to provide supplements for the fragmentary lines 16.5-8 that convey good sense from the perspective of narrative organisation and Bacchylides' poetic ingenuity. My method of doing textual criticism rests on the appreciation of intertextual connections between Bacchylidean narration and the traditions of early Greek epic and hymn, which advance points of deviation from literary predecessors and advertise Bacchylides' own poetic skills. I argue that the supplements I provide, can acquire a deeper meaning on the condition that context is taken into consideration. By context, I mean the authorial management of inter- and intranarrative co-ordinates that conduce to the shaping of discourse, as this has been established in past poetic instantiations.[1] In this way, answers are at one's disposal when it comes to problems of narrative coherence and subgeneric identification.

My understanding of the excerpt at issue is set to question the inference that Apollo stops by the river Hebrus on his way back from the Hyperboreans, and suggest that the narrator contrives a quandary about a different person at this site before the narrative focus is directed onto Apollo at Pytho:

Λοξ]ίου ἀίο[μεν][2] ἐπεὶ
ὁλκ]άδ' ἔπεμψεν ἐμοὶ χρυσέαν
Πιερ]ίαθεν ἐ[ὔθ]ρονος [Ο]ὐρανία,
πολυφ]άτων γέμουσαν ὕμνων.
κάλλιο]ν εἴ τις[3] ἐπ' ἀνθεμόεντι Ἔβρωι   5

1   For the role of context in matters concerning textual criticism in Bacchylides see Skempis 2020.

2   See Skempis 2019.

3   Maehler 1997, 158 has ἢ καλὸ]ν εἴ τις.

δρυσὶν ἀ]γάλλεται[4] ἢ δολιχαύχενι κύ[κνωι,
ὀπὶ ἀ]δεϊ̈αι[5] φρένα τερπόμενος;
αἶψα]δ' ἵκηι[6] παιηόνων
ἄνθεα πεδοιχνεῖν,
Πύθι' Ἄπολλον·   10
τόσα χοροὶ Δελφῶν
σὸν κελάδησαν παρ' ἀγακλέα ναόν.
(B. 16.1-12)[7]

We sense Loxias (approaching) because
fair-throned Ourania sent me
from Pieria a ship fraught with
much-celebrated songs.
Is it better for someone to take delight in the oaks
at the banks of flowery Hebrus or in the long-necked swan,
soothing his heart with its sweet voice?
Quick, come search for blossoms
of paeans on the soil,
Apollo of Pytho;
so many Delphic choruses have sung
next to your renowned precinct.

In my version of the text, the narrator, the poet himself, addresses Apollo Loxias at the outset. Then, he sets up a scenario according to which he is caught up in a dilemma about two varying ways of finding pleasure at Hebrus. The scenery changes in turn with what seems

---

4 Jurenka 1898, 112 suggests ἦρος before the verb ἀ]γάλλεται, Jebb 1905, 369 θηρσίν, Maehler 1997, 158 δάφναι, which is put forward by Blass 1898, 131, or μούσαι.

5 Kenyon 1897, 149: ὀπὶ ἡ]δεϊ̈αι; Jurenka 1898, 112 and Jebb 1905, 369: ὀπὶ ἀ]δεϊ̈αι; Blass 1898, 131: ὄφρ' ἀν ἀ]δεϊ̈αι. Maehler 1997, 158 is explicative of the *status quaestionis* in papyrological terms: "]δεϊ̈αι Pap.: das über das Alpha gesetzte Zeichen ist kein Längezeichen, sondern eher ein Zirkumflex, ähnlich den Akzenten über ϊ̈θεϊ̈αν in 15,54 und πεδοιχνεῖν in 16,9. D. A. Schmidt schlägt μελια]δε<ῖ> ἰᾶι mit Kürzung der Dativendung (ἰήν = βοήν, φωνήν) vor".

6 Maehler 1997, 158-9 thinks of πρὶν τό]δ' ἵκηι, though fails to notice the ensuing repetition of πρίν in the opening of the Heraclean section (16.13), which would make little sense: it creates a spatio-temporal discontinuity in the way the Hebrus scenery segues into the Delphi one because πρίν is a conjunction as opposed to its adverbial use in line 13 – my own argument smooths out the transition from one scenery to another through an adverb. Previous editors: Jurenka 1898, 112 reads νεαρῶν τ' αἴ κε], Blass 1898, 131 ὀπὶ Πυθόα]δ', and Jebb 1905, 369: μέχρι Πυθῶνά]δ'. I refrain from passing judgment on their supplements because they lack not only contextualisation, but also argumentation. On the contrary, I take special heed of both aspects in my approach in order to make a point as plausible as possible.

7 According to Maehler 1997, 6, the metrical shape of this section is as follows: –⏑⏑] νειτις ἐπ' ἀνθεμόεντι Ἔβρωι (= 4da ba|) | –⏑ ἀ]γάλλεται ἢ δολιχαύχενι κύ[κνωι (= 5da |) | ⏑⏑–⏑]δεϊ̈αν φρένα τερπόμενος (= ⏑⏑ 2da cho) | –⏑]δ' ἵκηι παιηόνων (= cho ia ||).

to be an anticipated epiphany of Apollo in his Delphic guise. The supplements I propose, designate an Apolline frame in the opening, paeanic section of Bacchylides 16. In the course of my argument, I shall point out that the midpoint of this Apolline frame is underpinned by allusions to cultic and narrative contexts linked with Apollo.[8]

The Apolline frame rests on what can be reckoned as a three-entry catalogue of placenames: Pieria (16.3), Hebrus (16.5), Delphi (16.11). The ordering of these sites in Bacchylides 16 shows semblance with the two multi-entry catalogues of placenames in the *Homeric Hymn to Apollo* (Thrace: 33-4; Pieria: 215; Pytho/Delphi: 372, 495-500, 516-19), the first of which (30-50) introduces the Delian section (19-78) and the second (216-45) the Pythian section (179-544). Contrary to the two appellations of Apollo in the upper and lower sideline of the frame, Loxias (16.1) and Pythian (16.10), which are indicative of the cultic setting at Delphi,[9] the three placenames point to the narrative setting of an extant text from the epic-hymnic tradition that hinges on the founding of Apollo's most celebrated cult-site at Pytho. The individual selection of the three sites from the two aforementioned catalogue contexts does not exactly forge a scenario of the god's veneration at Delphi. This leaves plenty of room for further investigating the effect of this awkward spatial configuration at the narrative level.

Keeping these preliminary observations in mind, I proceed to an account of the reasons, intertextual or other, that justify my conjectures:

[1] 16.5 κάλλιο]ν εἴ τις ἐπ᾽ ἀνθεμόεντι Ἕβρωι

This ought to be the opening of an indirect interrogative clause introduced by εἴ τις[10] in the sense 'is it preferable if one is to…?'.[11] The comparative form κάλλιον is in use in Homer in comparative, non-interrogatory contexts.[12] This particular form is unattested in Bacchylides,

---

8 Franklin 2013, 222 rightly argues that the dithyramb was occasionally linked with Apollo.

9 For the identification of Loxias with Apollo at Pytho see Clem. *Str.* 5.4.21.4 καὶ ὅ γε Ἀπόλλων ὁ Πύθιος Λοξίας λέγεται.

10 In Bacchylides, εἴ τις occurs four times in conditional clauses: 4.11; 5.190; 9.81; fr. 11.2 S-M.

11 Cf. Plut. fr. 86 Sandbach 'κάλλιόν τοι᾽ εἶπεν ῾εἰ φιλόπολις ἐκαλοῦ μᾶλλον ἢ φιλολάκων᾽. In archaic epic poetry, comparative + clause starting with εἰ is not common: Hom. *Il.* 17.417-19 τό κεν ἧμιν ἄφαρ πολὺ κέρδιον εἴη | εἰ τοῦτον Τρώεσσι μεθήσομεν | ἱπποδάμοισιν | ἄστυ πότι σφέτερον ἐρύσαι καὶ κῦδος ἀρέσθαι; *Od.* 6.282-3 βέλτερον εἰ καὐτή περ ἐποιχομένη πόσιν εὗρεν | ἄλλοθεν; 20.331-2 ἐπεὶ τόδε κέρδιον ἧεν, | εἰ νόστησ᾽ Ὀδυσεὺς καὶ ὑπότροπος ἵκετο δῶμα.

12 See Pi. *Pros.* fr. 89a S-M; Theocr. *Id.* 17.166-17.

who turns elsewhere to καλόν (9.82) and κάλλιστον (9.86; 10.47). Hesiod fr. 26 M-W is likely to have exerted considerable influence on the shape of Bacchylides' discourse. Porthaon's daughters take a morning walk around the fountain of the river Euenus where they seek flowers to adorn their heads, and Apollo fetches one of them, Stratonice, and brings her to his son Melaneus. The setting shows several affinities to Bacchylides 16 [rejoice (26.18 ἀγαλ[λόμεναι ~ 16.6 ἀ]γάλλεται), river (26.19 ἀμφὶ περὶ κρ[ήνην Εὐήνου ἀργ]υροδίνεω ~ 16.5 ἐπ' ἀνθεμόεντι Ἕβρωι; cf. 16.34 ἐπὶ ποταμῶι ῥοδόεντι Λυκόρμαι [= Euenus]), seek out flowers (26.21 ἄνθεα μαι[ό]μεν[αι ~ 16.9 ἄνθεα πεδοιχνεῖν), Apollo (26.22 Φοῖβος Ἀπόλλων ~ 16.10 Πύθι' Ἄπολλον)], not to mention that both stories include versions of how Heracles (26.33 Ἀμφιτρυωνιάδης ~ 16.15 Ἀμφιτρυωνιάδαν) conquers Oechalia (26.32 Οἰχ[αλ]ίη[ν ~ 16.14 Οἰχαλίαν) and carries off Iole (26.31 Ἰόλειαν ~ 16.27 Ἰόλαν). From a discursive point of view, it is possible that the thrice attested καλλ- stem in Hesiod (26.6 περικαλλέα in relation to ἔργα; 26.10 καλλιπ[λο]κάμ[ω]ν in connection to Νυμφάων; 26.27 καλλίζωνος with regard to Στρατονίκη) inspires the comparative κάλλιον.

Bacchylides exhibits a similar sort of contemplative interrogation in Bacchylides 4, a Pythian ode. Instead of setting forth the interrogative mode by dint of the suggested comparative (κάλλιον) and proceeding to a bifurcation of the compared items without pointing out a predilection, as he appears to be doing in Bacchylides 16, in Bacchylides 4 where Apollo at Pytho is praised on the occasion of an epinician ode for Hiero (4.1-6) and Ourania supplies the poet with hymns (4.7-10), the interrogative mode (4.18-20 τί φέρτερον ἢ θεοῖσιν | φίλον ἐόντα παντο[δ]απῶν | λαγχάνειν ἄπο μοῖρα[ν] ἐσθλῶν) takes the shape of a prioritised item against the backdrop of an omitted comparison: "what can be better than...?" instead of "is it preferable if... or...?".[13]

[2] 16.6 δρυσὶν ἀ]γάλλεται ἢ δολιχαύχενι κύ[κνωι

The person, who is located at Hebrus,[14] can be thought to rejoice in his heart with the oaks (δρῦς). *Iliad* 11 provides a narrative setting in which oaks and pines are singled out among trees in the natural environment of a river in flood, which is compared to Aias' fury in chasing after Hector by the banks of the river Scamander (492-501).[15] This is an inverted visualisation of what is close to the rivery *locus amoenus* in Bacchylides 16, yet it is noteworthy that

---

13 For simple interrogative mode see B. 18.3-11; 18.31-41.

14 For rivers (with preposition) in Bacchylides see 3.6-7; 5.38; 6.3; 9.39; 9.41; 11.26; 11.96; 13.193; 14B.5; fr. 20C.9-10.

15 On Hebrus and oaks see Nic. *Ther*. 461-2 (Orpheus); Scyl. *Per*. 67; Str. 7a.1.48.

oaks are part of a context that revolves around a stream. In the *Homeric Hymn to Hermes*, Apollo gives an account of the way Hermes drove his cattle to Pylos by drawing attention to how his baby-thief brother walked marvellously, as if he was stepping on slender oak trunks (*hMerc.* 349 ὡς εἴ τις ἀραιῇσι δρυσὶ βαίνοι). The topographical indication of Hebrus inscribes the story of the paeanic section of Bacchylides 16 in Thrace and the North-Eastern part of the Greek world. The semantics of δρῦς fit into this topography because there is a sacred grove near Bosporus named Δρῦς where a precinct of Apollo is located.[16] From this point of view, my conjecture δρυσίν is linked to contexts concerning a river, a cattle-raid, and a cult that all suggest Apollo.

The alternative form of pleasure one may take at Hebrus is in the long-necked swan, a bird connected to Apollo, as one infers from the *minor Homeric Hymn to Apollo*. In this narration, a swan is supposed to venerate the god with its song by the banks of the river Peneius (*hAp.* 21.1-3).[17] Although the Apollo/swan complex in Bacchylides 16 echoes the epic-hymnic tradition, the attribute δολιχαύχην modifies the Homeric *dis legomenon* δουλιχόδειρος 'long-necked', which is also ascribed to the swan.[18] In *Iliad* 2, the Caystrian streams above which swans, among other avian species, fly in pleasure (2.462 ἀγαλλόμενα), are compared to the river Scamander (2.467 Σκαμανδρίωι ἀνθεμόεντι). The second potentiality of the quandary at Hebrus endorses the rivery connotations of the swan because it alludes to Apollo's swan at Peneius in the *minor Homeric Hymn to Apollo* and to the long-necked swans of the Caystrian streams in *Iliad* 2.

[3] 16.7 ὀπὶ ἀ]δεΐαι φρένα τερπόμενος

'Soothing the heart with a pleasant voice' is a plausible statement about a person, who has the opportunity to take pleasure in the long-necked swan at Hebrus because it highlights the capacity of the swan to venerate the god with his exceptional voice. I want to stress the Apolline frame in which it can be interpreted by pointing out two narrative contexts that acknowledge a link to Apollo:

---

16   Dion. *Per Bosp. nav.* 26 Δρῦς· αἱ μὲν παρὰ τὸ ἡσύχιον τοῦ χωρίου καὶ σκεπανόν – θαλάττῃ γὰρ ἀπηνέμῳ προσκλύζεται –, Δρῦς δ' ‹ἀπ'› ἄλσους· τοῦτο δὲ τέμενος Ἀπόλλωνος. See Hoffmann 1841, 1542: "Die Gestade des Bosporos entlang […] waren durch Heiligtümer und Orte ausgezeichnet. So gab es dort einen Ort: Drys mit einem dem Apollon heiligen Hain".

17   For swan song in honour of Apollo at Hebrus see Ar. *Av.* 779-84.

18   Hom. *Il.* 2.460; 15.692.

a. in *Iliad* 1, the Danaans sing all day long a paean with a beautiful voice to propitiate Apollo, who soothes his heart in hearing them,[19] after Chryses has dedicated a prayer to him;

b. in the final section of the *Homeric Hymn to Hermes*, Apollo offers Hermes the power of divination to soothe his heart, which he is instructed to use in order to inform mortals about their fate through his voice.[20]

The Apolline connotations of these passages match the ones in Bacchylides 16 insofar as heart soothing is the outcome of a process that involves someone's voice.

[4] 16.8-9 αἶψα]δ᾽ ἵκηι παιηόνων | ἄνθεα πεδοιχνεῖν

αἶψα]δ᾽ ἵκηι[21] is conceived as a prospective subjunctive, which renders the expected realisation of an action.[22] In this sentence, the epiphany of Apollo at Pytho, not at Hebrus, is at issue (16.10). αἶψα + ἱκάνω is a formulaic expression that occurs in the *Homeric Hymn to Apollo* in a context relevant for the paean:[23] the band of Cretans, who have arrived at Crise, are headed toward Pytho, as they sing a paean in honour of the god, and quickly they reach Parnassus and the site where they were meant to found a temple.[24] This ought to be a strong argument for the view that the paeanic section of Bacchylides 16 does not recount Apollo's sojourn at Hebrus. On the contrary, it stages an abrupt shift of focus from the *locus amoenus* at Hebrus with its Apolline connotations to an imagined epiphany of the god at Pytho.

---

19   Hom. *Il.* 1.472-4 οἳ δὲ πανημέριοι μολπῇ θεὸν ἱλάσκοντο | καλὸν ἀείδοντες παιήονα κοῦροι Ἀχαιῶν | μέλποντες ἑκάεργον· ὁ δὲ φρένα τέρπετ᾽ ἀκούων.

20   *hMerc*. 564-6 τάς τοι ἔπειτα δίδωμι, σὺ δ᾽ ἀτρεκέως ἐρεείνων | σὴν αὐτοῦ φρένα τέρπε, καὶ εἰ βροτὸν ἄνδρα δαείης | πολλάκι σῆς ὀμφῆς ἐπακούσεται αἴ κε τύχῃσι. For the emphasis on voice in this section see *hMerc*. 543-5.

21   Jebb 1905, 370: "The lacuna in the MS. before δ᾽ ἵκηι could not hold more than six letters. But the scansion required for the lost syllables is ∪∪–– ∪ (cp. v. 20). To find six letters which shall give that metre, and also fit the sense, seems impossible. [...] It seems, then, almost certain that the text of the papyrus was defective here".

22   Prospective/anticipatory subjunctive (mode of prospective realisation): Hale 1894, 167-8; Smyth 1956, 405; Schwyzer, Debrunner 1988, 310.

23   *hAp*. 377 αἶψα δ᾽ ἵκανεν (the preceding context is explicative of Apollo's appellation Πύθιος [*hAp*. 372-3 ἐξ οὗ νῦν Πυθὼ κικλήσκεται, οἳ δὲ ἄνακτα | Πύθιον αὖ καλέουσιν ἐπώνυμον ~ Β. 16.10 Πύθι᾽ Ἄπολλον]).

24   *hAp*. 517-23 οἳ δὲ ῥήσσοντες ἕποντο | Κρῆτες πρὸς Πυθὼ καὶ ἰηπαιήον᾽ ἄειδον, | οἷοί τε Κρητῶν παιήονες οἷσί τε Μοῦσα | ἐν στήθεσσιν ἔθηκε θεὰ μελίγηρυν ἀοιδήν. | ἄκμητοι δὲ λόφον προσέβαν ποσίν, αἶψα δ᾽ ἵκοντο | Παρνησὸν καὶ χῶρον ἐπήρατον ἔνθ᾽ ἄρ᾽ ἔμελλεν | οἰκήσειν πολλοῖσι τετιμένος ἀνθρώποισι· | δεῖξε δ᾽ ἄγων ἄδυτον ζάθεον καὶ πίονα νηόν.

'Searching on the soil for flowers [of paeans]' is not just a suggestive metaphor for the amalgamation of nature and the production of song accommodated in a cultic context. From a discursive viewpoint, Bacchylides deploys a craftily constructed *hapax legomenon*, πεδοιχνεῖν 'look out for something on the ground',[25] to convey the process of selection that amounts to the recuperation of exquisite songs. πεδοιχνεῖν draws on *Iliad* 22 where 'searching on the soil' refers to the way in which a hunting dog goes after a deer in the woods just as Hector is pursued by Achilles.[26] The former is patronised by Apollo, but eventually falls (22.188-213): he meets Apollo to give him strength (22.203 ἤντετ᾽ Ἀπόλλων), who leaves him after he dies (22.213 λίπεν δέ ἑ Φοῖβος Ἀπόλλων). As it turns out, Bacchylides draws from the *Iliad*, which does not exactly flatter the god's patronising power, in order to conjure a celebratory Apolline setting.

The series of conjectures that I have posited for 16.5-8, takes into consideration that the outset of Bacchylides 16 sets up a paeanic frame for Apollo at Pytho. All the intertexts that I have pointed out, are shown to have a link with the god. The narrator is thought to contrive a quandary about how someone, not Apollo, may take pleasure at Hebrus. The initially posed paeanic section (16.1-12) justifies its existence through a specification of hymns provided by Ourania (16.4) in terms of Delphic paeans (16.8). I take this to be a subgeneric refinement of lyric song dedicated to Apollo[27] that is set to challenge the dithyrambic narration, which centres on Heracles: the inverted series of allusion to the *Homeric Hymn to Apollo*,[28] which immediately precedes the conjectured arrival of Apollo at Pytho,[29] suggests a link between the aetiological relation of the cult of Apollo Delphinios at Pytho with the paean and the traditional aetiology of the dithy-

---

25 I do not concur with Jebb's (1905, 371) erroneous view that πεδοιχνεῖν bears overtones of the poetry of Alcaeus.

26 Hom. *Il*. 22.192 ἀλλά τ᾽ ἀνιχνεύων θέει ἔμπεδον ὄφρά κεν εὕρῃ. For the passage see Richardson 1993, 127-30; de Jong 2012, 106-14.

27 For the hymn as generative song in praise of a god see Plat. *Leg*. 700b with Carey 2009, 26. On the hymnic nature of the paean see Aesch. *Pers*. 393; Eur. *HF* 687-95; *IT* 179-85; Tim. fr. 15 col. 5 199-205 *PMG*; *Carm pop*. 21 *PMG*; Xen. *Hell*. 4.7.4; Arist. *Pae. in Ap*. 45-8 *CA*; Mac. *Pae. in Ap. et Aesc*. 1-5, 23-7 *CA*; Phil. *Pae. in Dion*. 109-13 *CA*; Anon. *Pae. in Ap*. 5-6 Heitsch; Apoll. Soph. *Lex. Hom*. p. 126 Bekker; Herod. *De pros. cath*. vol. 3.2 p. 109 Lentz; Pol. *On*. 1.38; Procl. *apud* Phot. Bibl. 320a.21-4 Henry. Cf. Schmidt 1990, 22; Schröder 1999, 21; Furley, Bremer 2001, 84; Rutherford 2001, 47; Carey 2009, 27.

28 *hAp*. 517-19 Κρῆτες πρὸς Πυθὼ καὶ ἰηπαιήον᾽ ἄειδον, | οἷοί τε Κρητῶν παιήονες οἷσί τε Μοῦσα | ἐν στήθεσσιν ἔθηκε θεὰ μελίγηρυν ἀοιδήν ~ 16.2-4 ὁλκ]άδ᾽ ἔπεμψεν ἐμοὶ χρυσέα | Πιερ]ίαθεν ἐ[ΰθ]ρονος [Ο]ὐρανία, | πολυφ]άτων γέμουσαν ὕμνων; 16.8-10 παιηόνων | ἄνθεα πεδοιχνεῖν, | Πύθι᾽ Ἄπολλον.

29 *hAp*. 521 αἶψα δ᾽ ἵκοντο ~ 16.8]δ᾽ ἵκηι.

ramb that is based on dolphin imagery,[30] though here substituted by the use of an Apolline frame, which points to a different dolphin cipher.[31] The three sites of the paeanic section (Pieria, Hebrus, Pytho) are excerpted from catalogues of placenames in the *Homeric Hymn to Apollo*, which stages a spatial shift from Delos to Pytho. The introductory Apolline frame of Bacchylides 16 singles out these three sites in order to sketch out a gradual move from Pieria to Pytho, the venue of paeanic performances in honour of the god.

Bibliography

Blass, F. (1898). *Bacchylidis carmina cum fragmentis*. Leipzig: Teubner.

Carey, C. (2009). "Genre, Occasion and Performance". Budelmann, F. (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Greek Lyric*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 21-38.

Csapo, E. (2003). "The Dolphins of Dionysus". Csapo, E.; Miller, M.C. (eds), *Poetry, Theory, Praxis: The Social Life of Myth, Word, and Image in Ancient Greece. Essays in Honour of William J. Slater*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 69-98.

De Jong, I.J.F. (2012). *Homer: "Iliad". Book XXII*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Franklin, J.C. (2013). "'Songbenders of Circular Choruses': Dithyramb and the 'Demise of Music'". Kowalzig, B.; Wilson, P. (eds), *Dithyramb in Context*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 213-36.

Furley, W.D.; Bremer, J.M. (2001). *Greek Hymns*. Vol. 1, *The Texts in Translation*. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.

Hale, G. (1894). "On the 'Prospective Subjunctive' in Greek and Latin". *The Classical Review*, 8, 166-9.

Hedreen, G. (2013). "The Semantics of Processional Dithyramb: Pindar's *Second Dithyramb* and Archaic Athenian Vase-Painting". Kowalzig, B.; Wilson, P. (eds), *Dithyramb in Context*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 171-97.

Hoffmann, S.F.W. (1841). *Griechenland und die Griechen im Altertum mit Rücksicht auf die Schicksale und Zustände in der späteren Zeit*, Bd. 2. Leipzig: In der Dyk'schen Buchhandlung.

Jebb, R.C. (1905). *Bacchylides: The Poems and Fragments*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Jurenka, H. (1898). *Die neugefundenen Lieder des Bakchylides*. Wien: A. Hölder.

Kenyon, F.G. (1897). *The Poems of Bacchylides: From a Papyrus in the British Museum*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Kowalzig, B. (2013). "Dancing Dolphins on the Wine-Dark Sea: Dithyramb and Social Change in the Archaic Mediterranean". Kowalzig, B.; Wilson, P. (eds), *Dithyramb in Context*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 31-75.

30 On dithyramb and dolphin imagery see Csapo 2003; Kowalzig 2013; Hedreen 2013.

31 *hAp.* 493-6 ὡς μὲν ἐγὼ τὸ πρῶτον ἐν ἠεροειδέϊ πόντῳ | εἰδόμενος δελφῖνι θοῆς ἐπὶ νηὸς ὄρουσα, | ὣς ἐμοὶ εὔχεσθαι δελφινίῳ· αὐτὰρ ὁ βωμὸς | αὐτὸς δέλφειος καὶ ἐπόψιος ἔσσεται αἰεί ~ 16.10 τόσα χοροὶ Δελφῶν. Note the placement of πρῶτον *before* the aetiology of Apollo Delphinios at Pytho in the *Homeric Hymn to Apollo* and the *afore*placement of the paeanic section in the narration of Bacchylides 16.

Maehler, H. (1997). *Die Lieder des Bakchylides*. Zweiter Teil, *Die Dithyramben und Fragmente*. Leiden; New York; Köln: Brill.

Richardson, N. (1993). *The "Iliad": A Commentary*. Vol. 6, *Books 21-24*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Rutherford, I. (2001). *Pindar's Paeans: A Reading of the Fragments with a Survey of the Genre*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Schmidt, D.A. (1990). "Bacchylides 17 – Paean or Dithyramb?". *Hermes*, 118, 18-31.

Schröder, S. (1999). *Geschichte und Theorie der Gattung Paian: Eine kritische Untersuchung mit einem Ausblick auf Behandlung und Auffassung der lyrischen Gattungen bei den alexandrinischen Philologen*. Stuttgart; Leipzig: Teubner.

Schwyzer, E.; Debrunner, A. (1988). *Griechische Grammatik*. Zweiter Band, *Syntax und syntaktische Stilistik*. München: Eduard Schwyzer Verlag.

Skempis, M. (2019). "A Sense of Loxias: Bacchylides 16.1". *The Classical Quarterly*, 69, 435-8.

Skempis, M. (2020). ""Such as When…": Homer, Hesiod, and the Theban Cycle in Bacchylides 19". *Classical World*, 113, 125-46.

Smyth, H.W. (1956). *Greek Grammar*. Cambridge (MA): Harvard University Press.