

Chiang Kai-shek and His Time

New Historical and Historiographical Perspectives

edited by Laura De Giorgi and Guido Samarani

The Relationship Between Chiang Kai-shek and Chen Cheng in Taiwan as Appears from Chen Cheng's Diary

Hongmin Chen

(Zhejiang University, China)

Abstract In recent year Chen Cheng's personal diaries have been donated to the Academia Sinica's Institute of Modern History. This is a very valuable source to study Chen Cheng's personal history as a military and a politician, but also to gain a better understanding of the inner history of the Guomindang and its government and political dynamics before and after 1949. Using both Chen Cheng' diary and Chiang Kai-shek's diary, this paper investigates the relationship between Chen and Chiang Kai-shek in Taiwan as transpires from these documents. It focuses on some key moments of their relationship in the after-1949 period, as the first month after the Guomindang's retreat to Taiwan, and the span of time between 1958 and 1961, just before Chen Cheng's withdrawal from the political scene.

Summary 1 A General Introduction to Chen Cheng's Diary. – 2 Chen Cheng's Questioning of Chiang's Capacities After the Withdrawal to Taiwan. – 3 The 1958, Divergence of Opinion Regarding Chen Cheng's 'Cabinet Reorganization'. – 4 Chen Cheng's 1960 "Trip to Jinmen". – 5 The 1961 "Caoshan Controversy".

Keywords Diary of Chen Cheng. Chen Cheng. Chiang Kai-shek. Taiwan Years.

In recent years, the opening of the Chen Cheng Archives at the Academia Historica in Taipei (officially "Vice President Chen Cheng Heritage") and the publication of Chen Cheng's memoirs, letters and other historical materials concerning him have made the study of Chen Cheng and of the history of the Republic of China and of contemporary Taiwan much easier.

My own research focuses on Chiang Kai-shek in Taiwan and during a visit to Taipei in September 2012, I was informed that the scanning of another important source, that is Chen Cheng's personal diary, donated by the family to the Institute of Modern History at Academia Sinica, had been completed. Since I had never heard of the existence of Chen Cheng's surviving diary before, I was very happy, and immediately applied to view these documents before I left Taiwan. Unfortunately, on that occasion I could work on them for just a day. In fact, when I had the chance to go

Translated from Chinese by Laura De Giorgi.

Sinica venetiana 4

DOI 10.14277/6969-126-3/SV-4-3

ISBN [ebook] 978-88-6969-126-3 | ISBN [print] 978-88-6969-127-0 | © 2017

back to Taiwan and applied again to read the diary, I was told that, in accordance with the wishes of Chen's family, it was temporarily unavailable. To date, I am the only scholar who has had the opportunity to read Chen Cheng's diary held in those archives.¹

Due to the very short time (just one day) I was able to dedicate to this work, I concentrated on the sections of Chen Cheng's diary concerning Chiang Kai-shek. In this paper, I first introduce the diary and then investigate the relationship between Chen and Chiang Kai-shek in Taiwan as transpires from these documents.

1 A General Introduction to Chen Cheng's Diary

Chen Cheng's diary represents one important part of the material donated by Chen Cheng's family to the archives of the Institute of Modern History at Academia Sinica and it is available as digital images. Since I could read these documents only as computer files, and I have not been able to work on the originals, the documents quoted in this paper are indicated with their "digital image file number".

The diary consists of 28 volumes, which cover a period of 33 years from 1931 to 1964. Some years are missing, and in some cases even if the diary for that year exists, there are actually no daily entries.

The specific situation for each year is given below:

- 1931: two volumes, the first covering the period from January to June, 94 pages long; the second, 177 pages long, from July to December;
- 1932: one volume, 12 pages;
- 1937: one volume, 163 pages.

These first four journals were written in the "soldier's diary" issued by the Central Executive Commission of the Guomindang.

- 1939: four volumes, the first one is 85 pages long; the second just 4 pages, the "work diary for the inspections in Guangdong, Guangxi, Hunan and Chiangxi"; the third one is 61 pages long; and the fourth, 137 pages long, consisting of an ordinary notebook;
- 1940: one volume, 53 pages;
- 1942: one volume, 140 pages, on its cover is written "The Diary of Shi Sou (the old man of the stone, a pseudonym of Chen Cheng's)".
- 1943: one volume, 163 pages;
- 1944: three volumes, the first is 274 pages long; the second is just 58 pages long, and consists of the work diary of the inspections to Shaanxi and Henan; the third, the "Diary of Shi Sou" has 82 pages;

¹ According to a friend in Taiwan, the publication of *Chen Cheng's Diary* has already been planned.

- 1945: two volumes, the first is 31 pages long; the second 10 pages long, an ordinary school exercise notebook that says “army demobilization meeting”;
- 1946: one volume, 73 pages;
- 1950: one volume, 103 pages;
- 1954: one volume, 40 pages;
- 1955: one volume, only 7 pages;
- 1956: one volume, 32 pages;
- 1958: one volume, 239 pages;
- 1959: one volume, 190 pages;
- 1960: one volume, 241 pages;
- 1961: one volume, 267 pages;
- 1962: one volume, 266 pages;
- 1963: one volume, 252 pages;
- 1964: one volume, 27 pages. Chen Cheng’s last diary covers the period from 24 January 1964, to the date of his death on March 4, 1965, 13 months overall.

Starting from 1931, Chen Cheng’s diary covers fifteen years overall, since the diaries for the years 1933, 1934, 1935, 1936, 1938, 1941, 1943, 1947, 1948, 1949, 1951, 1952, 1953, 1957, 1965 are missing; moreover, he did not write every day in each year. Until 1961, there are only 267 pages, all told. Conversely, the diaries from 1958 to 1963 (six years) are relatively intact, and rich in content. As work diaries, they mostly did not concern Chen’s private life and feelings.

I do not know whether the Chen Cheng diaries held in the archives of the Institute of Modern History include all the diaries that Chen Cheng kept, or just the ones which were preserved or which his family decided to donate. It is my contention that it is just what survived. Since the diaries donated by the family also include a lot of information about the conflicts between Chen and Chiang, it is hardly likely something could have been hidden because of its sensitive nature. Nevertheless, Chen Cheng’s intermittent diary and Chiang Kai-shek’s long-term, continuous diary are in stark contrast. From the perspective of content, Chen Cheng’s writings are more similar to a “work journal”, describing work and travel activities as “records schedules”, barely touching on his personal life and emotions.

Despite the flaws, Chen Cheng’s diaries do cover the period of the anti-Japanese War, the Civil War and his life in Taiwan. Considering Chen’s status within the Guomindang, his diaries not only enrich what we know of his personal history, but also provide more insight into the history of the Guomindang, of the Republic of China, and of contemporary Taiwan.

The author is interested in offering a parallel reading of Chen Cheng’s and Chiang Kai-shek’s diaries in order to compare how some events were recorded by each in these sources.

2 Chen Cheng's Questioning of Chiang's Capacities After the Withdrawal to Taiwan

At the end of 1948, before Chiang Kai-shek stepped down, he hastily appointed Chen Cheng, at that time recovering from illness in Taiwan, to replace Wei Daoming as the Chairman of the Taiwan Provincial Government. In the struggle between Chiang Kai-shek and Li Zongren, Chen Cheng stood firmly by Chiang's side, and took several measures to stabilize the situation in order to lay the foundations for Chiang Kai-shek and the Guomindang regime's retreat to Taiwan. Chiang praised Chen Cheng's capacity to pacify Taiwan in 1949 highly:

At that time, if Cixiu (the *zi* name of Chen Cheng) had not been in charge of the political power and had not actively done the clean-up work, the situation would have been more dangerous than the February 28th Incident in 1947. (Chiang, *Riji* 1949, "This year's most depressing and difficult events", December 31)

Nevertheless, as it concerned the loss of the mainland, Chen Cheng initially raised doubts about Chiang's ability and approach. These doubts were not rare among the Guomindang's senior generals, an instance being Zhou Zhirou's complaints about Chiang's meddling in the military aviation's affairs (Chiang, *Riji* 1949, June 6).² Chiang was very sensitive regarding his generals' doubts (Chiang, *Riji* 1949, May 25).³

By the end of 1949, the United States were opposed to Chen Cheng's rule of Taiwan, and they put Chiang under pressure to replace Chen using American economic assistance as bait, "they use intimidation, if I do not replace the old leaders, I will not get any American aid" (Chiang, *Riji* 1949, November 16).

Aware he could not trust the United States and without any way out Chiang Kai-shek decided to "risk once again", and he replaced Chen Cheng with Wu Guozhen, whom the Americans preferred.

2 In Chiang Kai-shek's diary we read "after the morning prayers, I read the letter of Zhou Zhirou to Jingguo, it said 'the President still has direct control over the cadres, and this could potentially damage the power of the aviation's commanders'. When I read this I became very upset. I think that because Zhou did not agree to go to Taiwan and has some resentment towards Cixiu, he is unexpectedly jealous of my power, this is really unbelievable" (Chiang, *Riji* 1949, June 6).

3 As Chiang wrote in his diary on May 25th "I feel that the civil and military officers are arrogant, their attitude towards me is not the same as before, and Guo and Chen all like that". On June 6th he wrote: "This afternoon I summoned all the commanders, Liu Ruming, Wang Jingjiu, Shen Facao, Gui Yongqing, and Tang Enbo, to again discuss the defense of Taiwan with Cixiu and Xueting. The opinion of the commanders is quite strong, they complain that I interfere improperly; Zhou Zhirou's letter is quite revealing, it is really sad".

At that time, as governor of Taiwan, Chen really meant to make a difference and was very reluctant to resign, but eventually he complied with Chiang's decision. In his letter of resignation addressed to Chiang Kai-shek he wrote:

I would not accept to resign for the relationships with the Communist bandits; nor would I stand to resign for the relationship with Taiwan compatriots; I would be willing to do it just for our personal relationship and for these diplomatic relations there could be only resignation. You said that we must take the risk, and I will accept and stand humiliation. While serving, I encouraged myself to think that "in order to carry out an important mission you have no reason not to endure humiliation; if you want to complete it, you must necessarily accept it", and now I console myself with this. (Chen, *Riji* 1949, 740)

The passage from "I would not accept to resign" to "there could be only resignation" shows that Chen Cheng was surprised and puzzled, and that he even felt wronged by Chiang's decision. Eventually, though, he obeyed loyally.

On January 5th, 1950, while chairing a meeting of the Research Institute on Revolutionary Practice as president (*congcai*), Chiang Kai-shek acknowledged that the Guomindang's policies on the continent "must be considered as a complete failure", and that the causes of that failure were his own retirement and the fact that "the Guomindang had lost its center and was disorganized", stressing that "in the future we must start again" (Chen, *Riji* 1950, January 5).⁴

Chen Cheng spoke at the meeting, and pointed out that the withdrawal of a large number of troops and institutions to Taiwan had brought the island's economy close to collapse, and that it was imperative to consider how to stabilize the economical and financial situation:

1. As concerns military expenses, we must use what we need, but we must abide by the principle of not weakening the whole economy and finance; about the sale of public properties and goods, we must know who the purchasers would be, and once everything is sold what can we do?
2. (a) I hope that the funds regarding military expenditure will be kept in the Bank of Taiwan. (b) the number of personnel must be verified. (c) smuggling must be banned. All these three points must be accomplished, especially the verification, and to verify the officers is the most important thing (Chen, *Riji* 1950, January 5).⁵

4 Digital File Number (hereinafter DFN) 085-05-0018.

5 DFN 085-05-0018.

Chen Cheng's questions and suggestions show that he did not agree with Chiang Kai-shek's initiatives. Chiang sent Wang Shijie to persuade Chen not to be so negative. Chen Cheng said he was not negative, "but I do not know how I can be positive. Now, if we are taking a self-destructive way (selfish and self-deceptive), should we not change this destiny? Or should we commit suicide?" (Chen, *Riji* 1950, January 7).⁶ Chen Cheng believed that Chiang Kai-shek's priority should be to deal with the great issues, and he personally persuaded Chiang not to waste time on details, but "to focus on what was really urgent" (Chen, *Riji* 1950, January 8).⁷

A few days later, again chairing a meeting on political work, Chiang Kai-shek stressed that the most important reason for the loss of the mainland was the failure of the political work inside the army and that it was necessary to reconstruct.

Chiang specifically asked Chen Cheng to speak out, pushing him to express his opinions. Chen believed that the reason for the defeat in the mainland was first of all political, and only secondly military, and that "the political work in the army cannot bear the full responsibility for the military defeat" (Chen, *Riji* 1950, January 12).⁸ Holding a meeting on the political work was not urgent, so he said:

I do not oppose this policy, but in doing things there are some priorities. According to my observation the Communist objectives regarding Taiwan are: first, they expect that there may well be domestic unrest; two, they can infiltrate and instigate rebellions; three, they can carry out a military attack. The area we control in Taiwan is only 3/1000, and the population is 1/60; as for the time, January, February and March are the most valuable period, during this period we must not procrastinate, we must not be chaotic, nor make bad mistakes. As might be considered from the position of the President, the most urgent matters are: since nowadays there is anarchy and the people's hearts are shaken we must think how to improve the government and to reassure the people. The most urgent tasks of high functionaries and officers are: first organize the army, second prepare the war. Today we are not doing these things, it is frightening. (Chen, *Riji* 1950, January 12)⁹

Moreover, Chen Cheng did not agree with Chiang's proposal – raised at the meeting – to promote the policy of military farming units (*bingnong*)

6 DFN 085-05-0018.

7 DFN 085-05-0018.

8 DFN 085-05-0018.

9 DFN 085-05-0018.

heyi) as Yan Xishan had did in Shanxi Province, “[I] simply do not agree with such a backward idea”. As it concerned Chiang’s proposal for hiring former Japanese officers as advisers(which later became the ‘white group’), for “both the political and academic aspects”, Chen Cheng did not publicly express his opinion, but wrote in his journal, “with regard to this proposal, those in favour are few, only Wan Yaohuang does his best to support it because of his servilism” (Chen, *Riji* 1950, January 12).¹⁰ Obviously he disagreed.

During that time, Chen Cheng conducted a comprehensive self-examination regarding the causes of the failure of the Guomindang on the mainland. He wrote:

There are many causes for today’s defeat, but the most important factors have been that the leader did not distinguish the good from the evil, and this made the high officials self-deceptive and selfish to the point that in the domestic field they lost the support of the people, and in relations with the outer world, they refused the right help.

The critical key to the survival of the Party and the State, to the success or the failure of the revolution is that if the leader does not examine things he will be unwise, and if he does not decide he will not act with humanity; and if the cadres do not speak out they will not be loyal, and if they do not act, they will not be just.

Without wisdom and humanity, how can it not be a general evil?

Without loyalty and justice, how can the guilt not be deep?

In the domestic field, losing the heart of the popular masses, in the relations with the outer world, refusing the correct help, how can you expect anything other than defeat? (Chen 1950, January 12)¹¹

Chen Cheng pointed out that the main reason for the loss of the continent was Chiang: “A leader that does not distinguish the good from the evil, makes the highest officials self-deceptive and selfish, in the domestic field losing the support of the people, and in the relations with the outer world refusing the right help!”. He expected that Chiang did not want again to “not control” and “not decide”.

Basically Chiang Kai-shek thought he had Chen Cheng’s support, and when Cheng actually unexpectedly raised a divergent opinion, Chiang became very angry, as he wrote in his journal:

I went to the Institute (Institute on Revolutionary Practice - author’s note) for a meeting; we discussed the problems of the political work. In

¹⁰ DFN 085-05-0018.

¹¹ DFN 085-05-0018.

the end Cixiu (Chen Cheng – author’s note) spoke, full of resentment and disgust; he considers my words and deeds to be tortuous, and thinks that I interfere in all affairs, delaying everything and that Taiwan’s chaotic situation has been caused by this. The listeners were all stunned. I politely cut it all, since I think that his psychological state suggests he is sick, so I forgave him. (Chiang, *Riji* 1950, January 12)

Chiang Kai-shek was not satisfied with Chen Cheng, but in any case, Chen Cheng was the most trustworthy of his subordinates. Chiang sent Wang Shijie to persuade Chen Cheng, conveying two requests: Chen was to cooperate with the President of the Provincial Government, Wu Guozhen, and had “openly to solve his problem with Chiang Kai-shek”. Chen’s replies were: with regard to his non-cooperation with Wu Guozhen, “I cannot grant endless cooperation”; with regard to Chiang Kai-shek, “I can only obey”, but as concerns the issue of things that “cannot be done” or “must not be done”, “I think that a loyal officer must stand and talk, and he absolutely cannot deceive” (Chen, *Riji* 1950, January 17).¹² Wang Shiji had raised the hope that he could cooperate with Chiang Kai-shek, but Chen explicitly said: “I and the President cannot cooperate with each other, I just have to obey him” (Chen, *Riji* 1950, January 19).¹³

In that period there was no direct communication channel between Chiang Kai-shek and Chen Cheng. Chiang informed Chen of his wishes through other people.

On January 20, Huang Shaorong visited Chen Cheng informing him that Chiang intended to nominate Chen as Minister of Defence. Chen Cheng asked Huang to transmit his wish to decline the offer: “When I made my report this year, I offended too many people and I have only increased the difficulties of the President. I would not be of any help and I cannot take the position. Please inform the President”. He recommended Gu Zhutong and Lin Wei, inviting Chiang Kai-shek “to choose the one to put in charge” (Chen, *Riji* 1950, January 20).¹⁴

Chen Cheng supported the plan that Chiang should become reinstated as President as soon as possible. Chen thought that Chiang should not have too many scruples and himself limit his actions, “I think that a revolutionary action should be taken. Basically it is not possible to act according to the Constitution; at the very least he must first be restored to the office of President” (Chen, *Riji* 1950, February 5).¹⁵

12 DFN 085-05-0018.

13 DFN 085-05-0018.

14 DFN 085-05-0018.

15 DFN 085-05-0018.

On February 19th, the 3rd day of the first month of the lunar year, Chiang Kai-shek summoned Chen Cheng, in order to discuss how to force Li Zongren to accept the 'reinstatement'. Chiang proposed that if Yan Xishan were to resign as Premier, the position could be taken up by Chen Cheng. Chen declined the offer saying that "his physical condition did not allow him to do it", "his personal character did not fit", as a soldier he "was not so at ease as to accommodate himself in that place", and he invited Chiang "to consider someone else" (Chen, *Riji* 1950, February 19).¹⁶ At that moment, Chiang agreed to reflect on the issue. The following day, however, he unexpectedly summoned Chen Cheng again, to force him to accept the position. Chen recorded in the diary:

At 7 pm the President called me for a meeting, to discuss once again the question of the position of Premier. I strongly recommended Wang Xueting (Wang Shijie - author's note), and reported that Wang was afraid that Mr. Lifu (Chen Lifu) would not be cooperative. In the event Wang should not agree, it was possible to consider Chen Lifu, Wu Tiejing, Zhang Lisheng, Zhu Liuxian (Zhu Jiahua - author's note). In the end, he intended to ask for Wang's consent, but said that if Wang did not agree, he still hoped that I would take up the office, urging me to prepare myself in advance. (Chen, *Riji* 1950, February 29)¹⁷

On March 1 1950, in Taipei, Chiang Kai-shek took up his post once again ("I again shall serve") and was appointed President, with Chen Cheng appointed Premier. Chiang's decision was opposed by the Governor of Taiwan Province, Wu Guozhen, who was no friend of Chen's. When Chiang Kai-shek reflected on how to reconcile the two men, he blamed Chen's attitude and style above all:

Wu Guozhen is anxious because of Chen Cheng's appointment as Premier. He demands his dismissal. Since this is his intention, I have to reassure him, and how can I make him serve with tranquillity? Cixiu (Chen Cheng)'s temperament is narrow and intolerant. He is always overcritical, embarrassing many people. How can I deal with it? (Chiang, *Riji* 1950, February 22)

Chen Cheng reluctantly took up the office, but two months later he wrote a letter of resignation to Chiang Kai-shek, saying that his personality and skills "were not suited to a longer stay in the present position" (Chen,

16 DFN 085-05-0018.

17 DFN 085-05-0018.

Riji 1950, May 6).¹⁸ Chiang sent Huang Shaogu and Wang Shijie to appease Chen, and persuade him to stay on.

Chen Cheng was thoroughly dissatisfied with Chiang Kai-shek who would not listen to others' views and insisted on pushing forward his own ideas. At the time, Chiang Kai-shek was planning the retreat of the Nationalist forces from Zhoushan in order to have a better control of Taiwan. On May 9th, morning, Chiang presided over a military meeting to discuss the withdrawal plan. Chen Cheng opposed the military retreat [saying] that if it was necessary to retreat, it should be asked the officers, "to study how to remedy this". Moreover Chen warned that the recent military defeats were all caused by the habit of "deciding without investigating the situation and violating principles". Nevertheless, Chiang insisted on his decision, and that night he informed Chen Cheng that the navy had been sent to Zhoushan to carry out the military retreat.

Chiang pretentiously asked for Chen Cheng's opinion, and Cheng replied: "It is already decided, why quibble?". He recorded his deep disappointment in his diary: "It is very risky when the will of just one becomes action" (Chen, *Riji* 1950, May 9).¹⁹

These examples show how, during the first period following the retreat to Taiwan when Chiang Kai-shek did not yet control the situation, Chen Cheng questioned Chiang Kai-shek's capacity and style of action, and that Chiang was also aware of Chen's dissatisfaction.

3 The 1958 Divergence of Opinion Regarding Chen Cheng's 'Cabinet Reorganization'

In late June 1950, the Korean War broke out and the United States proceeded to help Chiang Kai-shek's regime. After he had cleared the difficulties, Chiang reshaped his autocracy and reinforced his control on the Party, the government, the military and Taiwan society adopting several measures. Chen Cheng was one of Chiang's most important collaborators in this process. During the 1954 'elections' Chiang chose Chen as 'Vice President'. Chen Cheng did not intend to take up this new position, and wrote in his diary about the discussions among Guomindang high level cadres about the candidates for the 'Vice Presidency':

In the evening, at Huang Shaogu's home we studied the President's political report. The Secretary-General Zhang raised the issue of the Presi-

18 DFN 085-05-0018.

19 DFN 085-05-0018.

dent asking if a Vice President could or could not hold another position at the same time and said that both Zhang Yuejun (Zhang Qun- author's note) and Yu Youren had expressed their desire not to run for Vice President. My idea is that Wang Lianglao (Wang Chonghui - author's note) is the best candidate for the position, and that also Zhang Yuejun could fit the profile. If Wang is elected as Vice President, Zhang can be the Premier. Moreover, I mentioned He Jingzhi (He Yingqin - author's note). Zhang thinks that the President will not consider He. (Chen, *Riji* 1954, January 5)²⁰

Chen Cheng considered Wang Chonghui and He Yingqin as the most suitable candidates. But Chiang Kai-shek preferred Chen Cheng, and he went on to nominate him. After Chen Cheng was elected, he resigned his position as Premier and became full-time Vice President. In 1957, during the 8th Congress of the Guomindang, Chiang Kai-shek proposed creating the role of Vice Chairman (of the Party), to be taken up by Chen Cheng. Chiang's reasons for creating the position of Vice Chairman were quite complicated: "The position of Vice Chairman is necessary for the success and safety of the current and future political affairs of the Party, but also more necessary for Chen Cheng and Chiang Jinguo as well" (Chiang, *Riji* 1957, September 27).²¹

After Chen Cheng became Vice Chairman of the Guomindang, his position as the second leader in Taiwan's political arena was fully acknowledged. By the end of 1957, Taiwan's political world was shaken by the case of the impeachment of the Premier Yu Hongjun by the Control Yuan, a case that was to cause political instability for more than six months. In the end, Chiang had to accept Yu Hongjun's resignation and invited Chen Cheng to take up the position of Premier. Chen Cheng was unwilling to accept. In his 1958 diary, this was especially evident in the list of great events detailing the situation.

February 13: the President has expressed the intention to reorganize the Executive Yuan after two or three months and chose me as Premier.

June 5: tonight I went to Jiaofanshan (Daxi), the President has again raised the issue of the reorganization of the Executive Yuan no later than mid-year (i.e., July 1) and asked me to take on also that position. I think it is not possible.

20 "Table of main events", DFN 085-05-0019.

21 Here, Chiang makes a comparison between Chen Cheng and Jiang Jinguo, but at that time Jiang Jinguo's position within the Guomindang cannot be compared to that of Chen Cheng.

June 6: today he has mentioned again the reorganization of the Executive Yuan. I will reflect and I have not answered yet. In the afternoon at 2.00 he mentioned the issue again.

June 26: the issue of the Executive Yuan has been raised again.

June 30: during the meeting of the Standing Committee, the President has brought up my name as Premier. I have again invited him to reflect on it. (Chen, *Riji* 1958)²²

During those four months of negotiations, Chen Cheng did not agree to act as Vice President and Premier at the same time. He was aware that there was a contradiction between the two positions: "According to the Constitution, the Vice President and the President should not have different opinions, but, as Premier, I have no way to avoid having different views from the President". (Chen, *Riji* 1958, July 28)²³

Chiang also recorded that Chen Cheng refused the position several times, including on June 26th when the two men talked of the matter, Chen "vowed he would not take up the position" using "quite vulgar expressions". Chiang insisted again and in the end Chen was forced to "accept this order". (Chiang, *Riji* 1958, June 26). On June 30th, at the meeting of the Central Standing Committee of the Guomindang, Chiang officially nominated Chen as Premier. After the nomination, Chen Cheng "stood explaining", with evasive words:

A Party member must obey the Party and the President totally, but I am unsuitable for the position of Premier. I repeatedly stated my view to the President. I cannot be redundant, I invite all the comrades in the Standing Committee to consider carefully so as to choose some other more virtuous and capable. (Chen, *Riji* 1958, June 30)²⁴

Chiang went to a lot of trouble to ensure that the appointment of Chen Cheng would be approved smoothly by the Legislative Yuan. The evening of the day of Chen's election, during his walk, he expressly went to Chen's home "to visit a sick person" (Chiang, *Riji* 1958, July 4).

Originally, Chen Cheng was forced by Chiang to accept the new appointment, which he did reluctantly, but after Chen Cheng began to organize the Cabinet, Chiang felt less sure about him and constantly interfered with his work, which occasioned serious divergence between the two.

In his selection of the members of the new Cabinet, Chen Cheng consulted Chiang Kai-shek several times. On July 6th, Chiang stressed to Chen that

22 "Table of main events", DFN 085-05-0022.

23 DFN 085-05-0022.

24 DFN 085-05-0022.

in future all policies were to be coordinated with regard to personnel matters, [saying that] “education is the most important”, and hoping that “the position of Minister of Education” would be taken by Zhang Qiyun (Chiang, *Riji* 1958, July 6). Nevertheless, Chen preferred the rector of Qinghua University, Mei Yiqi. Because of this, Chiang thought Chen’s political stance was not stable, that his way of acting was weak, since, when he selects staff, “[he] does not examine what is good and what is bad, he listens to the nice words of mean people; with regard to the people he does not pay attention to their fundamental political profile, moral attitude and academic qualities, but he takes their administrative role as criterion of his choice” (Chiang, *Riji* 1958, July 7).

Initially Chiang was ready to accept Chen Cheng’s proposal. However, when Chiang knew that the reason Chen did not want Zhang to remain in the position [of Minister of Education] was that Hu Shi and the others in the ‘Beijing University faction’ were jointly opposed to Zhang, his attitude changed drastically.

On July 10th, Chiang wrote: “Cixiu (Chen Cheng) does not tell the truth and he is tricky, he makes the others nurture doubts, and have the feeling that he is not sincere. This is one of the greatest losses, and especially a worry for Cixiu’s future. How to make him be more impartial, and take greater responsibilities?” (Chiang, *Riji* 1958, July 10).

Chen Cheng did not notice Chiang Kai-shek’s change of attitude and, in the choice of Deputy Premier he continued arguing with Chiang. Chiang indicated Wang Yunwu as Deputy Premier, but Chen Cheng unexpectedly wanted Huang Shaogu to keep the position. On July 10th, Chiang asked Zhang Qun to inform Cheng he should “rapidly decide the issue regarding the Deputy Premier and have Wang Yunwu succeed to the position” (Chiang, *Riji* 1958, July 10).

But three days later, Chen Cheng again met with Chiang Kai-shek, and continued to put forward the name of Huang Shaogu. Chen clearly perceived Chiang’s dissatisfaction for in that day’s entry in his diary he noted not only Chiang’s intransigence, but also his grievances for having been wronged twice:

9 o’clock, Chen Xuebin came to discuss nominations-tomorrow will the list of nominees for the Executive Yuan be ready to be submitted to the Standing Committee? I shall wait to meet the President before making the final decision.

10 o’clock, I met with the President, and he insisted on Wang Yunwu as Vice Premier and Huang Shaogu as Minister of Foreign Affairs. From his actual words you would think that he was just giving me advice, but the meaning of his words...in truth I had never heard anything like it in my life - it was stressful.

At noon, Yuejun, Lisheng, and Shaogu came for talks. I hoped that Shaogu would be encouraged to take the position of Minister of Foreign Affairs, and I waited for each one to take the final decision. In the afternoon, at 4 o'clock, I had a personal interview with Wang Yunwu, hoping that he would accept to act as Vice Premier. He let me speak and after an hour and forty minutes, he only replied that he would think it over for a night, and would give me his answer tomorrow morning. I immediately called Yuejun by phone to inform him in order to jointly persuade Wang. After an hour's talk between Yuejun and Yunwu he agreed, I did my best (he was not willing) and leave the rest to fate (there is no way to resist orders). (Chen, *Riji* 1958, July 13)²⁵

Chen Cheng eventually gave in and complied with Chiang's will. But Chiang felt that Chen was not wholly persuaded, and thought that Chen "was false and not sincere", a disappointment after three decades of painstakingly cultivating him (Chiang, *Riji* 1958, July 13).

Chiang and Chen's respective status and responsibilities were different, so the fact that they had different views on the make-up of the Executive Yuan should have been unsurprising, but Chiang had a preconceived prejudice that Chen did not tell the truth and intended to deceive him, and this angered him greatly. After Chen Cheng's Cabinet was complete, Chiang's anger did not disappear and he secretly went on hindering Cheng's policies. In early August, Chen Cheng accepted the Control Yuan's request and agreed to improve the economic conditions of civil servants and Forces men. But Chiang Kai-shek, while chairing the meeting of the Financial and Economic Commission, did not mention the matter, his intention being to let Chen understand that Chiang was the only one who could take the final decision concerning political directives.

Chiang, with some pride wrote in his diary: "The day before yesterday Cixiu at the Control Yuan arrogated to himself the right to announce that from this month on, the allowance of officers and lieutenants would be raised to 10 *yuan*, but his behaviour was not in line with the correct process with all his eagerness to win, so I ignored him" (Chiang, *Riji* 1958, August 15).

As regards the reason why he could not follow all Chiang Kai-shek's orders, an interesting conversation is reported in Chen Cheng's diary. Chiang Menglin once reported to Chen the following observation made by Zhang Qun: of what Chiang says, Chen just listens to one half, Zhang Qun to just two-thirds and only Yu Hongjun to one hundred percent. Apparently Chen Cheng agreed with this observation, but he replied that "listening to one hundred percent is equal to not listening at all; first Hongjun just

25 DFN 085-05-0022.

listens but does not act, secondly, when you act just obeying orders, not necessarily will society and officials listen too" (Chen, *Riji* 1958, April 12).²⁶

4 Chen Cheng's 1960 "Trip to Jinmen"

Notwithstanding his support for Chen, Chiang Kai-shek was also increasingly suspicious of him and hindered him in several ways.

When, in 1958, Chen Cheng in difficult circumstances complied with the order to take up the position of Premier, he had shown an exceptionally positive attitude, hoping that it could make a difference, and make him live up to Chiang's trust and expectations. Nevertheless, Chen Cheng did not understand Chiang's intentions. Chiang hoped that he would prove the kind of head who was a hundred per cent obedient, like Yu Hongjun, but Chen Cheng's keen determination to go ahead and to maintain his opinions seemed to such a suspicious person as Chiang Kai-shek just like an inclination for disrespectful rivalry and restiveness.

In 1960, presidential elections were to select the third President of the Republic in Taiwan. According to the Constitution, the President could be re-elected only once, so Chiang Kai-shek could not be elected again. The general opinion was that Chen Cheng would have no trouble being elected to succeed him. However, Chiang decided to run for office just the same, using various means to legitimate his 'illegal' behaviour, thus revealing his lust for power and the selfishness of his old age.²⁷ Inside and outside Taiwan where Chen Cheng's smooth succession was already taken for granted, the fact that Chiang stood for election, considering the climate then prevailing, seemed to convey the following message: according to Chiang, Chen Cheng was not yet qualified to 'take over'. Worse still, the envious within the Party thought that Chen Cheng's rise ought to be considered a joke. This was a severe blow for Chen.

There appears to be no hint in Chen Cheng's diary of his dissatisfaction with Chiang's participation in the elections. On the contrary, he always helped Chiang, putting pressure on opponents to persuade them to support him. On January 31st, Wang Yunwu expressed his "basic disapproval" of Chiang's re-election, arguing that, even if Chiang could have kept his position, it was not possible to justify it by means of a modification of the *Temporary Provisions Effective During the Period of Communist Rebellion*. He said "it is not possible to re-promulgate the *Temporary Provisions*" and I

26 DFN 085-05-0022

27 The most widely shared opinion is that Chiang Kai-shek, after his retreat to Taiwan, began to weigh up the opportunity of handing over power to his son, and to deliberately cultivate Jiang Jingguo. Chiang Kai-shek's election in 1960 was supposed to stop Chen Cheng, until conditions were ripe to transmit the power to Jiang Jingguo.

absolutely oppose any change of the maximum term of office, it will create endless troubles". Chen Cheng proposed: "at this point, if the President continues in his position, this will be quite legitimate and cannot have too many implications. In the current situation, fundamental reforms are excluded, for all the problems cannot be solved in a short time! In sum, the national situation must necessarily be steered and the President cannot but be re-elected" (Chen, *Riji* 1960, January 31).²⁸ His words helped Chiang.

The next day, Wang Shijie went to visit Chen Cheng to discuss the "issue of the presidency". Wang argued that the international situation did not favour Chiang's re-election and suggested "a government led by the Party" approach, with Hu Shi as President and Chiang holding political power as Premier. Chen Cheng disagreed with him, saying "we cannot ignore the reality that the President needs to be re-elected, and the current situation is unlikely to change". Wang agreed with Chen's judgment, but said "for the sake of the nation in the long term, I hope there could be the chance to change" (Chen, *Duan* 1960, February 1).²⁹

Among the voices of those who opposed Chiang's re-election, Hu Shi's was the most influential. He expressed his opinion on every occasion, infuriating Chiang (Chen, *Riji* 2011).³⁰ Chen Cheng and Hu Shi had a good relationship so Chen took the initiative to "have some consultations" in order to persuade Hu not to express his opposition publicly. Hu said in conclusion, "my opinion is still the same concerning the problem of the total duration of the roles published the day before in the *Independent Evening Post* (*Duli wanbao*), but I have decided not to express this opinion anymore" (Chen, *Riji* 1960, February 14).³¹

Election results returned Chiang as President, and Chen as Vice President. Chen Cheng immediately wrote to Chiang, resigning from his position as Premier. But Chiang refused Chen's resignation, saying that "the difficulties for the nation have not yet been relieved: there are still heavy responsibilities to bear; there is no discussion as far as your resignation from the position as Premier is concerned". Chen then resolutely stated once more that "I should no longer serve and can no longer serve as Premier", urging Chiang's approval. Chiang again replied that he would not give permission:

We are personally committed to the Party and the State. We've been engaged in revolution for decades, have shared joys and sorrows, ex-

28 DFN 085-05-0024

29 DFN 085-05-0024

30 Chiang speculated that Hu Shi and the others' opposition to his re-election was aimed at promoting his substitution by Chen Cheng, and afterwards having Chen as a 'puppet' controlling and managing political affairs.

31 DFN 085-05-0024

perienced dangers and difficulties. Now our country is in this critical situation and the people have placed their trust in us. We must expect to work harder, and bear the hardships. This means that it is not possible to resign. Your informal request has been kindly returned. Do not talk of resignation again. (Chiang 1960a, 795).

Chen Cheng had often in the past submitted his resignation so his resolve in the matter came as no surprise and could hardly be ignored. Yet from this moment on, Chen assumed a clearly passive attitude. When it was time again to reorganize the Cabinet, Chen disagreed with Chiang only regarding the roles of Huang Shaogu and Chen Xuebin, but it was not such a dispute as it had been two years earlier.

Chiang accepted the Cabinet list submitted by Chen, and moreover thought he had succeeded in his scheme: "I will listen to his will... and observe what follows. In this way, I have not enforced anything, and this will make him comfortable and encourage his self-efficiency, isn't this the way to employ a person?" (Chiang, *Riji* 1960, May 25).

This time Chiang was quite satisfied with Chen's demonstration of compliance, especially when compared with the rivalry which had beset the choice of the 1958 Cabinet: "In the talks with Cixiu about ministry personnel, everything has been quite arranged, generally, all has been decided; his proposals for the nominees mostly acknowledged my own intentions. He has demonstrated more loyalty in comparison with the previous reorganization of the Cabinet" (Chiang, *Riji* 1960, May 23).

What Chiang did not know was that this time Chen Cheng's compliance and 'acknowledgement' was a demonstration of passivity due to the loss of any hope of 'succeeding' him and of resigning. Chen Cheng expressed his repressed feelings when he replied to the accusations raised by the members of the Legislative Yuan during the June session. On June 9th, 161 members of the Legislative Yuan raised the issue to the Cabinet about the fact that Chen Cheng had remained Premier without authorization from the Legislative Yuan. On June 14th, Chen Cheng's proposal for adjusting the pay and conditions of the military, the civil servants and the professors, was again criticized by the Legislative Yuan. Chen complained that "with their envious attitudes, comrades' hatred has made them enemies" and angrily criticised the rhetoric of "cynical prejudices". The situation was evolving into a crisis as "the Premier waged war on the Legislative Yuan". On July 3rd, Chiang Kai-shek talked to Chen, persuading him to "train himself to keep calm", and as far as possible to have a "tolerant and calm temperament" (Chiang, *Riji* 1960, July 3). On July 7th, Chiang wrote to Chen Cheng and, using the admonition taken from the *Conversation of*

*a Man Who Lives on Vegetable Roots (Cai gen tan)*³² he advised Chen to “cautiously restrain his words”, asking him to go to Jinmen island to rest:

My younger brother, this time you should go to the outer islands and take a rest, for in all discussion you cannot show signs of anger, distress and discouragement. You should be more generous and carefree. If something unhappy occurs, I will deal with it properly, do not worry. (Chiang 1960b, 800)

However, we do not know why Chen Cheng not only did not listen to Chiang’s advice, but although many years had passed since his retirement from the military and his entering politics, he actually went to Jinmen dressed in uniform and with great fanfare. On July 17th he wrote two letters to Chiang, one quite formal and solemn, reporting his inspection of Jinmen defences, the second directly addressing the harsh political environment in Taiwan and his personal grievances, indirectly replying to Chiang’s July 7th admonitions, and once again asking to resign. Chen Cheng half affectionately, half complainingly wrote:

In these thirty years that I have accepted your guidance, I never avoided difficulties, when I had to face problems, have never been negligent, complaining or lazy, negative or pessimistic. Moreover, I have never searched for undeserved gain, nor have adopted an avaricious or selfish attitude. From winter 1930 when I received the order to go to Jiangxi against the Communist bandits until now, I have always motivated and consoled myself following the rule of ‘for what is right or wrong decide by yourself, for praise or criticisms listen to others, for gain or loss just follow destiny’, and ‘in order to carry a heavy burden, why hinder shame’, ‘if you desire to realize everything you will need to pursue tortuous paths’. Especially after the fall of the mainland and the Central Committee’s move to Taiwan, I was ordered to leave military activities and enter politics. Though I was not interested in politics, I knew that our country’s political environment was so bad, and then in these ten years, my entire attitude has ever been ‘having a sense of guilt, working hard to expiate’. But in the end my training has not been sufficient, my knowledge and capacity lacking, and my contribution has been minimal, worse, I raised resentment and hostility, increased your burden and damaged your reputation, how can I remain in office with a feeling of peace and endurance? On May 21st in addition to the request to remove me from the role of Premier, I personally explained that I don’t have

32 *Cai gen tan* is a morality book written by the late Ming scholar Hong Zicheng, first published around 1590.

the mind and feelings to be able to cover the position of Premier. But unfortunately I have not received your approval. So, as it has always been that 'to be afraid of danger is the way to ensure safety; to be afraid of perishing is the way to survive' and that 'people who have the same benevolence share the same worries', and 'people who are wicked all consort to each other', and is this not this case? (Chen 1960a, 801)

Chiang Kai-shek was furious when he received this letter, concluding that Chen had "a serious psychological problem", and that the question was very serious: Chen Cheng

is a narrow-minded person with a low degree of tolerance, recently he has been criticized by the opposition faction in the Legislative Yuan, which has contributed to today's situation, but actually all this has been caused by his inclination to speak a lot, being gullible, angry and doubtful, self-praising and arrogant. The excellent advantages of having him usually in charge of managing things are now overshadowed by his shortcomings, and he reflects not at all on this, is unaware of it in fact. What a pity especially for the future of the Party-State! (Chiang, *Riji* 1960, July 19)

Since he felt that there was a risk of losing control since Chen had left, on July 19th he sent the General Secretary of the President Zhang Qun to Jinmen with a personal letter, sternly commanding Chen to return immediately to Taipei: "In recent weeks, you have not been able to conceal your inner anger nor to control your emotions, I wish for us to solve all the problems of the present circumstances... this cannot come to be if you stay away, it is better for you to come back as soon as possible, and discuss the overall situation" (Chiang 1960c, 804).

As is proved in Chen Cheng's diary, he did not want to create any problems for Zhang Qun: "I decided to take the afternoon flight together with Yuejun to fly back to Taipei" (Chen, *Riji* 1960, July 20).³³ The day after, back in Taipei, Chen Cheng went to see Chiang. He has described this meeting in detail:

5.30 I had a meeting with the President. In addition to the inspection report and my impressions of the Jinmen situation, the President asked me to consider the present and the future of national issues. I said that from the very start I did not have any interest in politics, and since I was ordered to leave the army and to get into politics, I have only increased the President's burden and anxiety, and I feel guilty deep in my heart,

33 DFN 085-05-0024

actually I cannot solve this problem by myself, and often feel that I would be happy to die before the President.

In this conversation, I felt that the President's expectations in my regard were apparently great, but actually his doubts were deep. Moreover, mentioned when he travelled with Hu Shi, Wang Xueting, Jiang Menglin, and Mei Yiqi in past years, and for this he had decided to act as President for the third time, since he was the only one who could deal in the political world and said that I had my organization, and so on. (Chen, *Riji* 1960, July 20)³⁴

Chiang apparently showed he had great expectations of Chen, but actually, raising the issue of how two years earlier he had 'beaten' Chen, he said that Chen had his own faction. From what we can see from the diary, Chen believed that Chiang seemed to have great expectations but this was on the surface, while his doubts were "too real", and this was the basic truth. Chen was compelled to defend himself, and in desperation, he went so far as to say "I often feel I would be happy to die before the President" something close to a curse, hoping this would dispel Chiang's doubts. It is worth noticing that Chen Cheng was born in 1898, and was 11 years younger than Chiang Kai-shek.

Cheng's explanations did nothing to make Chiang Kai-shek change his mind, on the contrary he thought that Chen had a "hypocritical and deliberately false attitude in words and deeds" (Chiang, *Riji* 1960, July 23). Subsequently, he required that Chen Cheng read *The Biography of Von Moltke*, so as to make him understand his responsibilities and limits as a subordinate and an aide. Chen understood Chiang's intentions, and he specifically reported his impressions to Chiang after reading the book:

I honestly feel that an aide, in addition to understanding the international situation and the political environment, must especially : (a) know the cardinal principles, consider the overall situation, with loyal and fierce dedication, working unremittingly. (b) connect the higher and lower, transform the differences to similarities, temper losses and gains, and search to deal with them properly. (c) tolerate the words that people do not tolerate, and accept insults that people cannot accept. Otherwise, is it so surprising that he should harm himself and the country? (Chen 1960b in He 2007, 805)

Chen Cheng, who was well acquainted with Chiang's personality, had no ambitions of 'succession'. He considered himself an "aide" and, to Chiang, showed that he had to put into practice the three lines of "know the car-

34 DFN 085-05-0024

dinal principle, consider the overall situation". This was what Chiang had expected to see.

5 The 1961 "Caoshan Controversy"

In his record of great events of 1961, Chen Cheng wrote: "July 2, unforgettable day" (He 2012, 45). What happened on that day was so memorable that he had to write it down. On that day, for the first time, he had a personal confrontation with Chiang Kai-shek which developed a great quarrel.

Previously, the contradictions and differences between Chiang and Chen Cheng were in most cases a hidden war consisting of reciprocal insinuations, in 1961 they had a serious disagreement about the issue of 'counter-attacking the mainland', and since they both were impulsive and unable to control themselves, the conflict came out into the open.

'Counter-attacking the mainland' was the basic policy and objective of Chiang Kai-shek's rule in Taiwan. It was not easy for anybody to question it. Chen Cheng served as chairman of the Committee for the plans to recover the mainland, and he had been an active supporter and promoter of 'restoring sovereignty on the mainland'. But with the passing of time, Chen Cheng began to doubt the likelihood of success of the counter-attack and between the two goals of 'counter-attacking the mainland' and 'Taiwan's reconstruction' he gradually began to be more inclined to pursue the second, since he considered that 'Taiwan reconstruction' was the foundation of any plans to counter-attack the mainland (He 2012, 127). In 1958, while he served as Premier, he had raised the concern that the plans for a counter-attack had to take international factors into consideration. Indeed, by the late 1950s, Taiwan's psychological mood at any level was that to counter-attack was hopeless. In early 1961, Chiang Kai-shek drafted the "wild dragon plan", whose goal was to "take advantage of the opportunity to relieve the famine and hunger on the mainland", in order to carry out air attacks and launch an airborne invasion and to promote a "full-blown anti-Communist revolution on the mainland" (Chiang 1961).³⁵ By the end of June, Chiang received a secret report from Peng Mengji, which revealed that Chen Cheng had lost confidence in the 'counter-attack and recovery of the mainland'.

Chiang thought that, since two months earlier Chen had agreed with his decision "to start the counter-attack phase" and affirmed that "we have already decided wartime financial measures and military expenditures", now that Chen was suddenly opposed to the previous intent, not only had he lost faith in the enterprise, but also he did not care at all about Chiang's

35 *Minguowushinian dashi nianbiao* (Table of the main events of 1961).

prestige (Chiang 1961, July 30). Chiang angrily discussed this with Cheng Chen. Unexpectedly, the July 2nd argument, as Chen Cheng persevered in his divergent opinion and the quarrel was an angry one, turned into the famous 'Caoshan controversy'. Chen described the situation in detail:

The President intends to begin military operations in August. I think the counter-attack is right and I never thought the contrary, but we have to reflect if now is the appropriate time for the offensive. The President did not wait for me to finish talking, he was furious, thinking that I had doubts about the capacity of the army to fight and that I was going to destroy the commanders' prestige and obstruct the counterattack. I said that if the President spoke in that way it meant that he had doubts about my personality, not only about my ability to do things, but also about the correctness of my behaviour. When we counter-attack, though we cannot calculate everything, we cannot be fatuous about the war, for however slight, there is always a degree of risk to one's life in war. Can we ask how we can make the army not afraid to risk their life? And talking about the transportation, if we do not give enough time to the Ministry of Communication, how can it gather the naval forces? Not to talk about the other issues. When we began to quarrel violently, the First Lady came out to make peace. After the President was quite calm, he said that it was necessary to prepare actively (for the war). (He 2012, 45)³⁶

In his diary Chiang Kai-shek also recorded this event in detail:

I discussed the counter-attack with Cixiu: plan, guidelines, dates, and the reasons why this opportunity is difficult to take and easy to lose, and the fact that he should be responsible enough not to say that "the national army cannot fight", and this is an attack to the fighting spirit, to the prestige and leading capacities of the commanders. In this way it would not be possible to revive the confidence in the counter-attack in the future and I ordered him to pay particular attention to this. I informed him that I have already given the order of mobilization, and that I cannot cancel it myself, unless, because of his disapproval, he cancel it on my behalf. But since I want the counter-attack to receive domestic approval, the only thing to do is to sacrifice my position.

After he heard this, conscious that his conversation with Peng (Mengji) two days before had contradicted the position and dates agreed with me two months ago, he could not say a word as a reply, but only acknowledge he would proceed according to my ideas and dates. Was not this a

36 Besides his diary, Chen Cheng had also a "Work journal", where he recorded the schedule of meetings and visits; the July 2nd 1961 record is especially detailed.

great occasion to turn defeat into victory for my policy of counterattack?
(Chiang 1961, June 2)

Perhaps because of their different positions and different feelings about the debate, Chiang and Chen's accounts were quite diverse in focus: Chiang did not remember the quarrel and Chen's opinions. He gives the impression that he was always instructing Chen. Chen Cheng not only describes the quarrel and his views, but he also mentions the detail of Song Meiling's pacifying role. Both men stressed their respective positions and reasons, so it seems that at last the other side had made a concession, and each had prevailed. Chiang Kai-shek recorded, "(Chen) did not say a word in reply, he could only acknowledge he would proceed according to my ideas and dates". Chen Cheng wrote, "After the President was quite calm, he said it was necessary to actively pursue the preparation". It is only from this point that we know that their differences were not solved, the knot was not untied. Actually, Song Meiling, after this event, again went to Chen's residence to appease him, after which she informed Chen's wife, Tan Xiang, that "the two have an irritable character, they quarrelled for national affairs" (He 2012, 273). The arrogance shown by Chiang during the discussion greatly provoked Chen Cheng, who in his notebook "The Caoshan Controversy" recorded in some detail Chiang's criticisms and his answers and feelings:

The President met me and set out his criticisms of me. In this meeting his rage was very explicit, in a way that I've never seen in the forty years I've followed him. His criticisms can be summarized as follows:

(a) He blamed me for having destroyed his commanders' prestige (referring to the armed forces personnel);

(b) He accused me of obstructing his policy of counter-attacking the mainland (vaguely referring to military expenditures);

(c) he expressed his disappointment about these forty years of training and said that if he is no good, he will let me do all things.

My answers and thoughts:

(a) I am aware and I understand by myself that my learning is not good and my training insufficient, but I am second to nobody in believing in the decision and preparation for the counter-attack of the mainland. Moreover, with our ancestors' spirit and ethics of "knowing that it is not possible but doing it anyway", I will necessarily carry out the struggle against the Communist bandits until the end.

(b) My shortcomings are numerous and great, but I've never forgotten my responsibility and the ethical values.

(c) If there are doubts about my character, not only am I not able to act as Premier again, but I shall not even be able to be a moral person. My choice is to behave according to ethical values, I do not want to be an official.

(d) My intent is to follow the President in order to realize Sun Yat-sen's Three Principles of the People, rather than being an official, especially a high-ranking official.

I'm more than sixty years old. For decades I have worked hard without any complaints and without caring about slander, but in the end why?

If I had been just a little self-interested, I would never have been so stupid – careless of fame and blame and of physical exhaustion. (He 2012, 273)

After this quarrel, Chiang received the reports and Chen Cheng changed his attitude, becoming willing to make active preparations for the counter-attack (Chiang, *Riji* 1961, July 6). The Cabinet had already issued the "Provisional costs of the war", and ordered the Ministry of Transportation to schedule the gathering of the fleet, coordinating mobilization. Actually, Chiang Kai-shek's counter-attack military plans were limited by several factors, especially the containment of the United States. They were just illusions, and could not be implemented. On July 18th, Chiang looked for a way to sidestep: "I have decided to extend the preparation of the mobilization for the counter-attack by two months to conclude it by September. This is necessary because of the situation and moreover due to the common domestic psychological attitude; we must stoop to public opinion and relieve the financial pressure". At the end, he added one sentence: "Cixiu will be happier" (Chiang, *Riji* 1961, July 18). This sentence did not contain the previous wrath towards Chen. If anything, it held a somewhat self-deprecating tone, something very rare. In his heart of hearts, also Chiang thought that in these circumstances the counter-attack was really hopeless.

According to Chen Cheng's records, during the quarrel Chiang had said in wrath that, "if you think that I am not good, then you (Chen) should do it". This was tantamount to frankly saying in desperation that Chen Cheng was 'forcing him to abdicate'. Listening to these words Chen Cheng was shocked, and replied that this meant doubting his loyalty, and that if Chiang had this in his heart, he could be neither an official, nor even simply a moral person. These words really show that his profound worry was that Chiang should 'misunderstand' him, thinking that he aimed to replace him.

Not longer after this controversy, something else was to make Chen unhappy. In 1961, the UN General Assembly discussed the issue of 'China's representation', and Taiwan and the United States argued over how to keep the status of Taiwan in the United Nations. US President Kennedy asked Chiang to send "his closest officer" to the United States to negotiate. Chiang evidently knew that the United States meant Jiang Jingguo, but he preferred to send Chen Cheng as his personal representative to the United States. In the July 17 diary entry, Chen records that he was summoned from Taipei to Sun Moon Lake to see Chiang:

At noon I arrived at Sun Moon Lake. The president had summoned the minister Shen Changhuan to report on President Kennedy and Vice President Johnson's letter. This letter invited our President to send a trustworthy representative to the United States. I met the President at only half past twelve. I was not really happy. We talked a little and then had lunch, and resumed talking at half past five p.m. when he called me to go together with Minister Shen to the United States. I said that that my ability to speak is not good enough to convey his intentions, and I do not understand English, and I invited him to take into consideration Madame Chiang or the elder brother Jingguo, or the elder brother Changhuan. The President felt that I am generally appropriate for this. (Chen, *Riji* 1961, July 17)³⁷

Since Chiang Kai-shek had treated his 'Vice President' Chen Cheng quite coldly, first directly talking alone with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Chen's feeling of being "not very happy" is certainly understandable. Chen Cheng's refusal was not entirely an act of courtesy. Two days later, when Chen and Jiang Jingguo had a conversation, he again expressed that "he was unfit" to go to the United States, "because he was not good at talking and feared to damage the face of the President and the Nation" (Chen, *Riji* 1961, July 19).³⁸ Nevertheless, Chiang insisted on sending Chen Cheng on an official visit. Fortunately, when he was in the United States, Chen faithfully implemented the guidelines decided by Chiang and withstood American pressure, insisting on Taiwan's 'original position'. This made Chiang very satisfied and "even delighted" (Chiang, *Riji* 1961, August 5).

The 1961 July quarrel was a final catharsis and Chen Cheng's last protest, after which he completely abandoned his feisty spirit, and repeatedly submitted his request to resign. In December 1963, Chiang approved Chen Cheng's resignation as Premier for health reasons. Chen immediately sent a letter to Chiang to thank him: "After my reiterated requests, I am finally relieved from this burden. I accept your caring concern and will keep it always in my heart". He further requested Chiang to permit him "to be exempted from the circulation of all the documents and from the participation in various meetings and ceremonies" in his various posts as Chairman of the Committee for projecting the recovery of the mainland, as Vice Chairman of the Study group of the Constitution, as Vice Chairman of the Guomindang, and as Vice President, in order to focus on health, recovery and rest (He 2012, 833). The public motive for Cheng's retirement was health, but afterwards in a letter to his daughter he plainly said, "I am in good health".

37 DFN 085-05-0025.

38 DFN 085-05-0025

Chen Cheng's last diary record was written on January 24, 1964, but after 1961, in his diary there is no longer anything which concerned his relationship with Chiang Kai-shek.

As mentioned earlier, Chen Cheng's diary does not concern his personal life and feelings, however, as can be seen from the above examples of his dissatisfaction concerning Chiang Kai-shek, it does give us a new understanding of the relations between Chiang Kai-shek and Chen Cheng in Taiwan, since besides their long close co-operation, there were also contradictions and conflicts between them.

Bibliography

- Chen, Cheng 陈诚 (1949). "Shouni qing ci Taiwan sheng zhuxi" 手拟请辞台湾省主席 (Handwritten Request to Resign from the Position of President of Taiwan Province). He Zhisen 何智霖 (ed.) (2007), *Chen Cheng xiansheng shuxin ji: yu Chiang Zhongzheng xiansheng wanlei handian* 陈诚先生书信集: 与蒋中正先生往来函电 (Chen Cheng's Collected Letters: The Correspondence with Chiang Kai-shek), vol. 2. Taipei: Guoshiguan, 740.
- Chen, Cheng 陈诚 (1960a). "Han cheng zhengzhi huanjing zhi elie" 函呈政治环境之恶劣 (A Letter About the Harsh Political Environment). He, Zhisen 何智霖 (ed.) (2007). *Chen Cheng xiansheng shuxin ji: yu Chiang Zhongzheng xiansheng wanlei handian* 陈诚先生书信集: 与蒋中正先生往来函电 (Chen Cheng's Collected Letters: The Correspondence with Chiang Kai-shek), vol. 2. Taipei: Guoshiguan, 801.
- Chen, Cheng 陈诚 (1960b). "Han cheng lun wei jiang zhi dao" 函呈论为将之道 (A Letter on the Future Path). He Zhisen 何智霖 (ed.) (2007), *Chen Cheng xiansheng shuxin ji: yu Chiang Zhongzheng xiansheng wanlei handian* 陈诚先生书信集: 与蒋中正先生往来函电 (Chen Cheng's Collected Letters: The Correspondence with Chiang Kai-shek), vol. 2. Taipei: Guoshiguan, 805.
- Chen, Cheng 陈诚 (1963). "Han cheng kenzhun bingchu zawu zhuanxin jingshe" 函呈恳准摒除杂务专心静摄 (A Letter to Ask for Permission To Be Relieved from Duties and To Concentrate on Rest). He Zhisen 何智霖 (ed.) (2007), *Chen Cheng xiansheng shuxin ji: yu Chiang Zhongzheng xiansheng wanlei handian* 陈诚先生书信集: 与蒋中正先生往来函电 (Chen Cheng's Collected Letters: The Correspondence with Chiang Kai-shek). Taipei: Guoshiguan, 833.
- Chen, Cheng 陈诚. *Riji* 日记 (Diaries). Unpublished manuscript, digitized. Archives of the Institute of Modern History. Taipei: Academia Sinica.
- Chen, Hongmin 陈红民; Duan, Zhifeng 段智峰 (2011). "Xiangyi he qita.Taiwan shidai Jiang Jieshi yu Hu Shi dui bici jian jiaowang de jilu" 相异何其大——台湾时代蒋介石与胡适对彼此间交往的记录 (How Great Was the Difference? The Interactions Between Chiang Kai-shek and Hu Shi in Taiwan). *Jindai shi yanjiu*, vol. 2, 18-33.

- Chiang, Kai-shek 蒋介石 (1960a). "Shou yu suo Chen gaige yijian ying ji yan-ni shishi" 手谕所陈改革意见应即研拟实施 (Instruction to Study the Implementation of Chen's Proposals of Reform). He Zhisen 何智霖 (ed.) (2007), *Chen Cheng xiansheng shuxin ji: yu Chiang Zhongzheng xiansheng wanlei handian* 陈诚先生书信集: 与蒋中正先生往来函电 (Chen Cheng's Collected Letters: The Correspondence with Chiang Kai-shek), vol. 2. Taipei: Guoshiguan, 795.
- Chiang, Kai-shek 蒋介石 (1960b). "Shouyu zhenyan guayan" 手谕慎言寡言 (Instruction To Be Cautious in Speaking). In: He, Zhisen 何智霖 (ed.) (2007), *Chen Cheng xiansheng shuxin ji: yu Chiang Zhongzheng xiansheng wanlei handian* 陈诚先生书信集: 与蒋中正先生往来函电 (Chen Cheng's Collected Letters: The Correspondence with Chiang Kai-shek), vol. 2. Taipei: Guoshiguan, 800.
- Chiang, Kai-shek 蒋介石 (1960c). "Shou yu cong huan huilai gong shang daji" 手谕从速回来共商大计 (Instruction To Come Back Soon To Discuss the Plans). He, Zhisen 何智霖 (ed.) (2007), *Chen Cheng xiansheng shuxin ji: yu Chiang Zhongzheng xiansheng wanlei handian* 陈诚先生书信集: 与蒋中正先生往来函电 (Chen Cheng's Collected Letters: The Correspondence with Chiang Kai-shek), vol. 2. Taipei: Guoshiguan, 804.
- Chiang, Kai-shek 蒋介石. *Riji* 日记 (Diaries). Unpublished manuscript. Stanford: Archives of Hoover Institution.
- He, Zhisen 何智霖 (2012). *Chen Cheng xiansheng huiyilu: liushi zishi* 陈诚先生回忆录: 六十自述 (Chen Cheng's Memoires: Sixty Autobiographical Accounts). Taipei: Guoshiguan.

