Monitoring Central Asia and the Caspian Area

Development Policies, Regional Trends, and Italian Interests edited by Carlo Frappi and Fabio Indeo

Government-Private Sector Relations for Sustainable Development in Central Asia

Antonio Somma

Independent Board Member of Development Bank of Kazkahstan, former Head, OECD Eurasia Competitiveness Programme

Abstract The article deals with the implementation of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Central Asia, including the roles of public and private sector, the opportunities stemming from public-private relations and the expected sustainable development outcomes. Some common SDGs outcomes can be observed across Central Asia, such as the eradication of poverty and the reduction of inequalities. However, results of SDGs implementation in the region are varied. In order to stimulate cross-learning and to address regional SDG challenges, it is recommended to establish a permanent Central Asian regional platform for SDGs implementation. At regional and domestic level, governments can play a decisive role to support SDGs implementation and stimulate sustainable development. Governments can produce enabling regulations, effectively co-operate with the private sector and facilitate access to quality finance.

Keywords Sustainable development. SDGs. Emerging economies. Central Asia. Government. Private sector development. Public-private dialogue. Regulation. Access to finance.

Summary 1 Introduction. – 2 Potential for SDGs Implementation in Central Asia. – 3 Role of Government-Business Partnership for Private Sector Development. – 4 Sustainable Development: Role of the Public Sector.



1 Introduction

The adoption of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) by United Nations members in 2015 laid a common framework for advanced and emerging economies in their quest for better environment, lower inequalities, more peace and prosperity.

The SDGs framework shifted the meaning of development from a focus mainly on the needs of poor countries, to one that emphasizes well-being and sustainability in all countries. In order to implement SDG and translate them into concrete beneficial outcomes, partnerships are needed amongst all stakeholders, including governments, private sector, academia, civil society and NGOs to name a few.

This article deals with SDGs implementation in Central Asia, looking at the potential of SDGs implementation in the region, the role of a government-business partnership, and the opportunities for sustainable development.

Table 1 SDGs Agenda's "5Ps".

People	Goal 1. End poverty in all its forms everywhere
reopte	Goal 2. End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote
	sustainable agriculture
	Goal 3. Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages
	Goal 4. Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all
	Goal 5. Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls
Planet	Goal 6. Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all
	Goal 12. Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns
	Goal 13. Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts
	Goal 14. Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development
	Goal 15. Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial
	ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and
	reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss
Prosperity	Goal 7. Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all Goal 8. Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all
	Goal 9. Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation
	Goal 10. Reduce inequality within and among countries
	Goal 11. Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable
Peace	Goal 16. Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development,
	provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels
Partnerships	Goal 17. Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development

2 Potential for SDGs Implementation in Central Asia

Implementation of SDGs in Central Asia is a major opportunity for three reasons at least. First, the content of SDGs themselves. Second, the help that the overall SDG framework can provide for the reform programs of the countries of the region. And third, the cross-boundary impacts of SGDs. It is also an opportunity for countries of the region to come together and further strengthen their dialogue.

The SDG Index and Dashboards Report 2017 of the Sustainable Development Solutions Network shows varied implementation performances of Central Asian Countries. Kazakhstan is amongst the top performers in the region and, together with Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan, ranked in the first half of the 150 surveyed countries, and better than some OECD member countries.

Table 2 Ranking of selected Central Asian countries by SDG, out of 150 surveyed countries

COUNTRY	тот	SDG1	SDG2	SDG3	SDG4	SDG5	SDG6	SDG7	SDG8
Afghanistan	144	135	133	144	151	155	154	113	152
Kazakhstan	46	1	96	87	53	26	39	92	46
Kyrgyzstan	66	58	49	94	62	71	68	52	135
Mongolia	90	23	93	102	55	51	108	124	49
Tajikistan	83	107	143	98	39	95	101	39	128
Turkmenistan	146	1	65	97	64	99	155	97	148
Uzbekistan	50	109	38	78	24	82	113	84	98
COUNTRY	SDG9	SDG10	SDG11	SDG12	SDG13	SDG14	SDG15	SDG16	SDG17
Afghanistan	156	15	144	11	41	n.a.	142	131	109
Kazakhstan	57	6	57	131	110	n.a.	127	78	142
Kyrgyzstan	120	7	58	72	69	n.a.	89	108	51
Mongolia	99	34	123	86	133	n.a.	78	107	102
Tajikistan	119	25	103	18	107	n.a.	84	39	53
Turkmenistan	139	87	94	58	135	n.a.	108	77	157
Uzbekistan	101	60	106	50	9	n.a.	111	23	1

Key:	В	Top 50% on overall performance				
		Bottom 20% performance by SDG				
		Top 30% performance by SDG				
C	Causes author's analysis has a day Daytelessany Ctiffying and Cystainable					

Source: author's analysis based on Bertelsmann Stiftung and Sustainable Development Solutions Network (2017).

¹ Chile, Israel, Turkey, Mexico.

Several Central Asian countries have eradicated extreme income poverty (Goal 1) and have performed well on reduction of inequality (Goal 10). Kazakhstan ranks well also on sustainable water management (Goal 6) and on gender equality (Goal 5).

Kazakhstan has emerged as the potential leader in SDGs implementation in the region. For example, the country systematically incorporates global standards in its strategy and national reform planning. In the past years, around the time of SDGs adoption by the UN membership, Kazakhstan has designed and implemented a number of structured reform plans, such as Kazakhstan 2050, 100 concrete steps to implement 5 institutional reforms,² national 2025 Strategic Development Plan and, more recently, the Five Social Initiatives.³ In the meantime, Kazakhstan has been one of the three countries in the world that have implemented an OECD Country Programme, designed to facilitate the adoption of OECD standards and instruments by non-member economies.

Much remains to be done to implement the SDG in Central Asia. Main challenges remain Goal 8 (promoting sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all), Goal 9 (building resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation), and also Goal 11 (inclusive urbanization), Goal 15 (protecting ecosystems).

In several other SDG, the performance is rather uneven across the region and there is clearly scope for peer learning. Some countries of the region ranked at the top performance on individual SDGs (see table 3).

² The five institutional reforms are: (1) Creation of a modem and professional civil service; (2) Ensuring the rule of law; (3) Industrialization and economic growth; (4) A unified nation for the future; (5) Transparency and accountability of the state.

³ The Five Social Initiatives are: (1) New Opportunities for Purchasing Housing for Each Family; (2) Reducing the Tax Burden to Increase Wages of Low-paid Workers; (3) Increasing the Accessibility and Quality of Higher Education and Improving the Living Conditions of Students; (4) Expansion of Microcredit; (5) Further Gas Supply of the Country.

Table 3 Highest Ranking of selected Central Asian countries by SDG, out of 150 surveyed countries

COUNTRY	SDG1	SDG2	SDG4	SDG5	SDG6	SDG7	SDG10	SDG12	SDG13	SDG16	SDG17
Afghanistan							15	11			
Kazakhstan	1			26	39		6		_		
Kyrgyzstan							7				
Mongolia	23						34				
Tajikistan			39			39	25	18		39	
Turkmenistan	1										
Uzbekistan		38	24						9	23	1

Key:	Top 30% performance by SDG				
Source: author's analysis based on Bertelsmann Stiftung and Sustainable					
Development Solutions Network (2017).					

To address regional SDG challenges and to stimulate cross-learning on SDGs in Central Asia, the opportunity to create a permanent Central Asian SDG Platform (Hub) could be explored. SDGs are global, aspirational and inspirational by nature. They are global because when individual countries progress on them other countries are impacted by spillovers. They are aspirational because they set the same goals for all the countries and they are not a race. They are inspirational because the rankings do not mean competition, but rather they indicate which countries could be a source of inspiration for others. Central Asian countries could effectively cooperate on the implementation of SDGs: to support each country's domestic reform agenda, to share good practices with neighbors, and ultimately to further consolidate the region's position in the international arena.

3 Role of Government-Business Partnership for Private Sector Development

In recent years, business has been increasingly looking at governments' support to address the most pressing issues of our times, be them the financial crisis of 2007 and 2008, the planet's continued habitability, or fostering stable and inclusive economic growth, to name but a few.

Government responses to this growing demand have been varied, with some governments still perceived by businesses as too bureaucratic and struggling to cope with the fast-changing business environment. Those governments that have taken action have displayed mixed success in providing institutional structures needed for the private sector to operate.

The introduction of SDGs stressed the urgent need of enhancement of government relations with the private sector and other stakeholders. In fact, one of the SDGs, Goal 17, explicitly refers to strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development. Moreover, the SDG framework is holistic, global and action-oriented by nature, and begs for enhanced policy and institutional coherence by identifying policy interactions. trade-offs and synergies across economic, social and environmental areas; and considering transboundary and intergenerational effects.

SDGs require a change of mindset: from silos to whole-of-government partnership, including in policy making, to stimulate networks of effects. For example, access to clean energy, safe drinking water and food (Goals 2, 6 and 7) can promote health (Goal 3). However, demand for energy, drinking water and food is also expected to increase as prosperity increases (Goals 7 to 11). While using more land for agriculture will help end hunger (Goal 2) it may undermine efforts to curb loss of biodiversity (Goal 15) and put stress on water resources, therefore adversely affect Goal 6.

Central Asian countries that perform best on individual SDGs have indeed displayed ability to leverage network effects. For example, Uzbekistan ranked 38th out of 150 surveyed countries on SDG2 (End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture). It notably reduced prevalence of undernourishment to 5% of its population, prevalence of wasting in children under 5 years of age to 4.5%, by reaching a cereal yield of 4.8 tons/hectare. Kazakhstan ranked 39th out of 150 surveyed countries on SDG6 (Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all). Its performance is the result of providing access to improved sanitation facilities to 97.5% of the population, reducing freshwater withdrawal (that is, the ratio between total freshwater withdrawn by all major sectors and total renewable freshwater resources) to 18.4%, and containing imported groundwater depletion to 2.8 m3/year/capita.

In order to maximize network effects, Governments (as a whole, not only individual ministries or agencies) and business are evolving their relations from being counterparts to each other to becoming partners to help coherence across a range of policy fields - economy, investment, environment, energy, but also migration, education, development co-operation and more. In particular, relations between governments and business are evolving from consultation to publicprivate dialogue and increasingly to partnership.

⁴ Wasting is low weight for age; the indicator measures children age 5 years and under whose weight for age is two or more standard deviations below the median weight for age of a reference population. Wasting is caused by acute food shortages and/or disease, and is strongly correlated with under-5 mortality.

3.1 Consultation on Reform

Consultation allows developing regulations in an open and transparent fashion, with appropriate procedures for effective and timely inputs from interested national and foreign parties.

It should of course include potential domestic and foreign investors as well as affected business, trade unions, civil society, wider interest groups and other levels of government. As long as the government handles comments from interested parties, it enhances the credibility of the process and the prospects of regulatory compliance by the economic actors.

Consultation is widely used in OECD countries. For example, Ireland, in the context of its Open Government Partnership (OGP) National Action Plan of 2014, designed a "Consultation Principles & Guidance" document to help decision-makers make better decisions and improve in the quality of service provision. The document provides three principles of consultation: 1) real engagement, 2) easy accessibility, and 3) involvement of all stages of the policy process: development, implementation, evaluation, and review.

Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan and other Central Asian countries have or are planning institutional consultation mechanisms, involving both domestic and international private sector. Kazakhstan established a Council for Improving the Investment Climate, chaired by the Prime Minister. It is a platform for ongoing consultation with investors on reforms aimed at enhancing the country's business climate. In Uzbekistan, following the recent wave of reforms since 2016, discussions are ongoing regarding the most appropriate setup for public consultation on reforms.

Consultation is a first important layer of interaction to ensure that involved parties understand the nature of new regulations, why it is needed and what is expected of them. Its main outcome is better quality of specific policies. It reassures current and potential investors seeking opportunities by facilitating more regulatory certainty. However, it is still silos-based.

3.2 Public-Private Dialogue (PPD)

PPD brings together government, private sector and relevant stakeholders to achieve shared policy objectives and play a transformational role for a particular set of issues. The scope of PPD is wide and involves multiple policy areas. They include for example, improving the investment climate, building sector competitiveness, managing natural resources, improving public service delivery.

PPD is typically a formalized structure for private sector dialogue with government, ongoing monitoring of outputs and outcomes, and

program to disseminate information. Participants in PPD include the ultimate beneficiaries of reforms, civil society organizations, labor unions to ensure a more balanced and inclusive reform process.

PPD's outcomes include better identification and analysis of roadblocks, agreement on development objectives, and assessment of the issue at stake, recommendations on policy and legislative reforms, identification of development opportunities, definition of action plans.

PPD is an established policy tool in OECD economies, used for particularly sensitive issues that involve multiple stakeholders. For example, Australia established the Regional Export and Investment Group (REICG) for the discussion of Federal and State Government interests with private sector exporters to overcome historically adverse trade terms for Australian exporters. The objectives of REICG were to encourage and facilitate existing exporters into new markets and to create export awareness and foster the development of an export culture. Participants included exporters, potential exporters, Austrade officials, State Government officials, Department of Business, local government, Chamber of Commerce, industry group representatives, academics and regional development managers. Participant reported that this PPD increased confidence in professionalism of officials, stimulated peer learning, and supported networking to serve the needs of local businesses.

Some Central Asian countries have sought to stimulate Public Private Dialogue in recent years, leveraging technology to reach a wide audience. Kazakhstan has established an online tri-lingual platform (Kazakh, Russian and English) for PPD, as part of its wider e-government program. The platform allows citizens to express their opinion on existing and new policies. In 2015, the Government of Mongolia called a cellphone referendum in the midst of the re-negotiation of a large contract with a major mining company: (A) push ahead with more foreign investment in the mining sector, or (B) pursue an austerity program, slashing public spending.

PPD helps build trust around discussions on important reforms and provides stakeholders with capacity and credibility to help deliver quick and concrete results.

3.3 Partnership-Based Platforms

While PPD continues to be an effective approach to policy reforms, also owing to the use of technology, SDGs require even deeper collaboration. It shall be driven by a more open and scope-flexible interaction platform and a more proactive private sector, including in implementation of policy reforms and government plans. Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) are an example of this evolution. According to the World Bank, to meet the investment needs of the Sustainable Development Goals, the global community needs to move the discussion from "Billions" in Official Development Assistance⁶ (ODA) to "Trillions" in investments of all kinds: public and private, national and global, in both capital and capacity. "Billions to trillions" is shorthand for the realization that achieving the SDGs will require more than money. It needs a global change of mindsets, approaches and accountabilities to reflect and transform the new reality of a developing world.

The private sector shall be given increased responsibility on growth and development, for example through specific agreements on major investment projects (the PPP) or on improving the overall business climate. For example, the OECD publishes the Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises, a set of government-backed recommendations on responsible business conduct in existence today. The governments that adhere to the Guidelines aim to encourage the positive contributions MNEs can make to sustainable development and to minimize the difficulties to which their various operations may give rise.

In Central Asia, Kazakhstan has been taking the lead in PPP. The parliament approved a new Law on PPP in 2015. Its declared focus is on development of infrastructure in the public interests, implementation of socially significant projects in education, health care, transport, power industry, and housing and public utilities. According to the 2019 Public Private Partnerships Review of Kazakhstan by the OECD Working Party of Senior Budget Officials, the Kazakh law implies a broader PPP definition than OECD countries. The law's guiding principles include the possibility to implement PPPs in all sectors of the economy, a broad definition of PPPs contracts, such as service contracts, after-sales service contracts and leasing agreements. The law allows for 3 to 30 year PPP contracts. While it is early to assess the outcome of the PPP law, it is worthwhile noticing that some large projects have been signed under its framework, including logistic infrastructures related to the "One Belt One Road" initiative.

The shift from silos-based consultation to government-private sector partnership seems the set path for public-private sector relations. One question remains open: which are the metrics to assess co-operation paths between the business sector and public authorities, especially in a world that has seen decreasing trust in public and pri-

⁶ Currently, ODA amounts to some US\$ 135 billion. When adding other flows for development, including philanthropy, remittances, South-South flows and other official assistance, and foreign direct investment the amount is nearly US\$ 1 trillion.

vate institutions? General metrics would include maximization of the private sector company value and improvement of the overall business environment. This is the focus of the last section of this article.

4 Sustainable Development: Role of the Public Sector

The public sector can play two complementary roles in creating new jobs and facilitating inclusive growth: regulatory environment and financial support.

4.1 Regulatory Environment

Governments shall first improve overall investment climate, which in turn will unlock private resources for sustainable development. Gaps in key policy areas related to investment shall be filled – including infrastructure, small and medium-sized enterprises, public governance (including anti-corruption policy) and investment for green growth – and the regulatory framework for long-term, quality investment shall be strengthened. In this respect, the OECD Policy Framework for Investment (PFI) is a comprehensive and systematic support tool for governments, such as investment facilitation, trade policy, access to finance, skills development.

More specific reforms focus on: gender equality, entrepreneurship, climate mitigation and adaptation to climate change, sustainable management of water and sanitation, inclusive urbanization. For example, inclusive urbanization is central to achieving SDG 11 to make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable. In this area, the main challenges that OECD and non-OECD economies face include curbing global carbon emissions; providing adequate water supply and sanitation; establishing efficient public transport networks; dealing with informal settlements and shanty towns; and reducing vulnerability to risks related to natural disasters.

Kazakhstan has already taken several steps in the reform of the regulatory environment. The country has already reached OECD standards on several investment climate dimensions (National treat-

⁷ The PFI provides the OECD standard on the following policy areas: Investment Policy, Investment Promotion and Facilitation, Trade Policy, Competition Policy, Tax Policy, Corporate Governance, Responsible Business Conduct, Human Resources for Investment, Investment for Infrastructure, Access to Finance, Public Governance, Investment for Green Growth.

ment, PFI,8 Responsible Business Conduct).9 It underwent two OECD Investment Policy Reviews which allowed it to become an adherent to the OECD Declaration on Investments. Results have been obtained on more specific policy areas. For example, in the 2016 Global Gender Gap report of the WEF, Kazakhstan ranks ahead of Austria and other 8 OECD members, at 51 out of 144 countries.

4.2 **Financial Support: Facilitating Quality Finance**

Quality financial supports can greatly enhance impact of public investments, development finance for green economy, and generally access to finance. In order to facilitate quality finance, the various Levels of Government can assess their public investment capacity, with the objective to identify fiscal gaps, create a climate of trust and accountability, and enhance the multi-level governance of public investment.

In Kazakhstan, the role of government-owned development finance institution National Management Company (NMC) Baiterek is pivotal in implementing the governmental policies to fund, for example, sustainable agriculture (SDG 2), healthcare (SDG 3), water management (SDG 6), sustainable energy (SDG 7), infrastructure, inclusive and sustainable industrialization and innovation (SDG 9), better housing (SDG 11).

Moreover, a specific focus should be put on resolving non-performing loans (NPLs). High levels of NPLs are being a common issue in several OECD and non-OECD economies, including several Central Asian countries. In addition to hampering credit growth, NPLs can create a serious economic disturbance. NPLs also harm the inclusive growth path, given their link to unemployment. The resolution of NPLs does not have to entail bail-in procedures. Governments may consider establishing "bad" asset management companies and/ or take supervisory measures to encourage banks to resolve NPLs, including additional regulatory capital for long-standing NPLs.

Stimulating sustainable growth must include both financial and non financial aspects in order to create the proper environment. A more specific and tangible metric relates to the creation of sustainable jobs. It is also of fundamental importance for the growth of com-

⁸ Recommended additional improvements on: national treatment, national security-grounded restrictions, hiring key foreign personnel, balancing investment protection and the government's power to regulate, balancing tax policy and investment incentives and disincentives, investment promotion and facilitation, trade policy, Infrastructure development, competition policy, corporate governance, public governance, responsible business conduct.

⁹ Including liberalization, reforms of formerly restricted sectors such as telecommunications, deregulation and reducing the regulatory burden for businesses, establishing business ombudsman.

petitiveness, the sustainability of the economy in the long term, and ultimately its ability to benefit a large part of the citizens.

Bibliography

- ADB (2015). From Billions to Trillions: Transforming Development. Finance Post-2015 Financing for Development: Multilateral Development Finance. ADB News Release, 17 April. URL https://www.adb.org/news/billionstrillions-transforming-development-finance (2019-11-19).
- Auvezbaveva, Talmira: Tussupova, Saule (2013), Development Banks and Their Role in Facilitating Economic Growth. Proposed Research Background in case of Kazakhstan. URL https://ssrn.com/abstract=2338150 (2019-11-20).
- De Luna-Martínez, José; Vicente, Carlos Leonardo (2012). Global Survey of Development Banks. Policy Research working paper, no. WPS 5969. Washington, DC: World Bank. URL http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/313731468154461012/Global-survey-of-developmentbanks (2019-11-20).
- Department of Public Expenditure and Reform [Ireland] (2016). Consultation Principles & Guidance. URL https://www.ihrec.ie/app/uploads/2019/03/DPER-Consultation-Principles-and-Guidelines-2016.pdf (2019-11-20).
- Herzberg, Benjamin; Sisombat, Lili (2016). State of Play. Public-Private Dialogue, Public-Private Dialogue (PPD). Practical Notes Series. Washington, DC: World Bank Group.
- Miyamoto, Kaori; Chiofalo, Emilio (2016). Official Development Finance for Infrastructure: With a Special Focus on Multilateral Development Banks. OECD Development Cooperation Working Papers, No. 30. Paris: OECD Publishing.
- OECD (2018a). OECD DAC Blended Finance Principles for Unlocking Commercial Financefor the Sustainable Development Goals. URL https://www.oecd.org/ dac/financing-sustainable-development/development-financetopics/OECD-Blended-Finance-Principles.pdf (2019-11-20).
- OECD (2018b). Reforming Kazakhstan: Progress, Challenges and Opportunities. Paris: OECD Publishing.
- OECD (2019). Public Private Partnerships Review of Kazakhstan. 12th Meeting of the OECD Network on Governance of Infrastructure and PPPs. URL http:// www.oecd.org/officialdocuments/publicdisplaydocumentpdf/?c ote=GOV/PGC/SB0(2019)3&docLanguage=En(2019-11-20).
- Sachs, Jeffrey et al. (2017). SDG Index and Dashboards Report 2017: Global Responsibilities, International Spillovers in Achieving the Goal. Bertelsmann Stiftung and Sustainable Development Solutions Network. URL https:// s3.amazonaws.com/sustainabledevelopment.report/2019/2019 sustainable_development_report.pdf (2019-11-20).
- United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (2001). Survey of Good Practice in Public-Private Sector Dialogue. United Nations: New York and
- Yamashiro Fordelone, Talita (2009). Triangular Co-operation and Aid Effectiveness, can Triangular Co-operation Make Aid More Effective?. Paris: OECD Publishing.